

PalArch's Journal of Archaeology  
of Egypt / Egyptology

## LOCAL GOVERNMENTS WITHOUT GOVERNANCE IN SINDH

<sup>1</sup>Jalil Ahmed Chandio , <sup>2\*</sup>Siraj Ahmed Soomro , <sup>3</sup>Allah Dino

<sup>1</sup>Mehran University of Engineering & Technology, SZAB Campus, Khairpur.

<sup>2</sup>Department of Pakistan Studies, Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur.

<sup>3</sup>Ph. D scholar, Department of Pakistan Studies, Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur.

Jalil Ahmed Chandio , Siraj Ahmed Soomro , Allah Dino , Local Governments Without Governance In Sindh , Palarch's Journal Of Archaeology Of Egypt/Egyptology 18(10), 1467-1474. ISSN 1567-214x.

**Keywords: Local Governments, Governance, Sindh, Pakistan, Qualitative Study.**

### Abstract

This research paper aims to determine the weaknesses and some strengths of the Local Government Governance in Sindh. It is indicating the reasons why the local government system is failing in Sindh for example, conflicts of the political parties like PPP, MQM etc. It is defining the Local Government Act 2013 of Sindh and the major findings related to the political system, lacking the capabilities of local government and other important knowledge to show that how local governments in Sindh has no governance. This study is, therefore, is also giving some guideline to the current government of Pakistan in order to increase the resources and funding to the local governments of Sindh for the purpose their improvements for the whole society or state.

## **1. Introduction**

The topic of this research study is 'local governments without governance in Sindh'. Local governance is defined as small governance of any small area such as of any geographic area, a place like a city any town or region. Local governance cannot pass important laws which could impact the overall wide region. Likewise, governance is defined as a set of rules and laws which are necessary to enforce for the betterment of society or individuals. This study is describing the latest information on the current situation of Local governments without governance in Sindh. It is describing the situation in different parts of the province of Sindh where local governments' governance has almost been abolished.

The study of Akbar (2018), therefore, has described the situation of local governments in Sindh as the study of Ghanghro, Phulpoto and Memon (2016), explained that; Sindh was struggling with the situation where local government has no governance in Sindh but during the year 2016, local government bodies again reintroduced in Sindh after the gap of almost six years and a well-established local governments system introduced with a high quality. After the reintroduction of the LG system in Sindh, in this current time, it is facing a challenge of no governance in Sindh province due to numerous conflicts and contradiction between parties (Ghanghro, Phulpoto and Memon, 2016). The study is making the best use of qualitative research studies from prior research studies on the same topic to reach the aims and the objectives.

### **1.1 Research aim and Objectives**

This study aims to define the gaps or no governance of the Sindh local governments. Following are the objectives of this research study;

To determine the deep insights on no-governance of local governments of Sindh

To analyse the situation of the local government of Sindh that is the reason for deprived good political economy

### **1.2 Research Questions**

What is the situation of local governments in Sindh?

How the local government in Sindh has no governance? Analyse-it.

## **2. Methodology**

The research methodology is very much important for this research because it helps to determine the overall structure of research as in this research study, the methodology is indicating the aspects which have been utilised in maintaining the following research on the topic 'Local governments without governance in Sindh'. The main parts of the methodology section are defining the overall theme of this research study.

### **2.1 Philosophical aspects of the research**

It means the philosophy which is going to follow in the research therefore; this research study is following the interpretive approach as a philosophical nature. The main reason to use this approach is, it allows conducting Meta-analysis on a certain research topic. The interpretive

approach has several advantages for instance; it slows a researcher to convey deep thoughts about the following topic in several ways through interpreting the information from numerous prior studies. The study of Glesne (2016), had defined the importance of interpretive approach according to which it allows integrating secondary research with qualitative studies which is one of the most important benefits achieves from this philosophical approach.

## **2.2 Data collection**

The data collection process for this study is qualitative that means, the whole research study comprises upon reviews of the authors from prior research studies on the same topic. Qualitative studies which have been used to define different themes in this research concerning the topic-local government without governance in Sindh, all contain qualitative research (Mays, Pope, 2020). The main reason to choose qualitative research is, it allows carrying information easily from various documents, research papers, journals and other online resources (Woods et al., 2016). Qualitative research study on the following topic can clear the minds of people about the practices of the local government of Sindh because it is elaborating the activities of local government by presenting deep insights qualitatively. Qualitative studies also provide easiness to critically presenting the research topic.

## **2.3 Inclusion and exclusion criteria**

This research study particularly contains inclusion and exclusion criteria, for example, the exclusion criteria of the study include; all the research studies that were old or older than past five years such that of the year 2000-2015 are excluded in the research. This research study also excluded all the matter that was not related to the context of the following research topic. On the other hand, inclusion criteria of this study include; all the current information on the activities of the local government of Sindh such as the data from 2016-2020 years papers, documents, journals or from the online resources.

## **2.4 Data analysis**

The data analysis process of this study includes a constant comparative analysis because it is allowing a researcher to fully critically analyse the deep concepts of the literature on the following topic.

## **2.5 Limitations of the research**

This study contains limitation due to the absence of quantitative data but this limitation has been coped with the use if a constant comparative analysis technique. A constant comparative analysis also helping a researcher to neglect false results for the study thus, not any result of this research study is false.

## **2.6 Criteria for selecting the studies**

Research has utilised the studies that were from online papers, news, journals and mainly from research papers of the past five years. Online data sources have helped a researcher to fully present a new research study on the following topic.

## **2.7 Criteria for selecting sample studies**

Criteria for selecting some sample studies include; studies which have the string qualitative information in the form of results from any survey on the activities of Sindh's local government. This study has also used keyword search approach to make the research process much faster.

### **3. Sindh Local Governments without governance**

According to the study of Brown and Ahmed (2016), it has determined that Sindh has become a province of British India during the year 1936, after when it had separated from the Bombay presidency. In the form of the administrative and political unit along with the different boundaries Sindh since many exist and links to the Indus valley civilisation. Since many years, Sindh has maintained its local governments' system in different cities or parts of the state. Sindh has its own local government known as Faislo and it is with almost 47 million people according to the past information of population from 2013 research and according to the census of 2017. Sindh is the second largest province of Pakistan with respect to population (Rid and Murtaza, 2019).

The Sindh province is significantly divided into seven administrative divisions and almost twenty-nine districts. The seven divisions of Sindh local government includes the cities of Karachi, Hyderabad, Khas, Sukkur, Larkana and other new districts of Shaheed Benazir Bhutto division. Like the districts, Sujawal and Badin have been separated from the Hyderabad in order to make Bhambhore division and the twenty-nine districts of Sindh to divide the practices or activities among the local government, are divided into Union Councils which is the basic unit of the local government in Sindh (Rid and Murtaza, 2019). Therefore this research study is integrating the analysis of the weaknesses and some of the potential strengths of the Sindh Local governments system and no-governance of the Sindh local government to determine its major weaknesses.

The study of Ghanghro, Phulpoto and Memon (2016), had critically defined the current Local governance system of Sindh by introducing the elected regime which is much more important to ensure the greater political ownership. The elections to reintroduce the Local governments held on the party basis to provide the clear division of labours in rural areas mainly (Murtaza et al., 2016; Siddiqui and Safi, 2019; Akbar, 2018; Ghanghro, Phulpoto and Memon, 2016). Likewise, the study of Jabeen (2018), had defined the several gaps about the ability of Sindh LG bodies according to which they are not meeting the proper LG functions such as, law enforcement in local departments like building control and the city developments. Local governments in Sindh are not well or fully aware of their roles, for example; to perform establishments or developments, in local areas like in any geographic part or city the funding from government and following governmental policies is crucial; in this regard, local government system is not receiving proper funds from the Sindh government and the presence of opposition parties in Sindh is creating conflicting situations; as a result, local government encounters with no governance situation in province (Malik and Rana, 2019).

According to the study of Malik and Rana (2019), there is a lot of overlap and ambiguity in terms of financial powers between the different tiers of local governments in Sindh. Similar to this, the study of Malik and Rana (2019), had critically explained that the local government act of Sindh 2013 also does not mandate the immediate re-election for the local governments and the past delays in local elections disturbed the pleasant activities in many areas. In addition to this,

army-controlled areas in the different parts of Sindh province such as, in Karachi city, various army-controlled cantonment areas have their separate local governance but it is much more confusing because the system is following no governance or bad practices (Murtaza, 2017).

From the study of Murtaza (2017), it has analysed that the system of local governments' governance has been abolished in Sindh as also said by **Dr Kaiser Bengali**. Instead of distributing powers to the local bodies, provincial governments are making companies because political parties are discriminating the ethnic minorities for example; in Sindh, it was the time when MQM was on peak and the actions of MQM now, not in an action. This local party has become the most dominant political party in Sindh but then it has abolished all the activities from cleaning the cities to the construction of parks and other areas (Murtaza et al., 2016; Siddiqui and Safi, 2019; Akbar, 2018; Ghanghro, Phulpoto and Memon, 2016).

Due to the abolish activities of mainly MQM in Sindh, local governance has disturbed. Now the current challenge for local governments in Sindh is to perform their activities like cleaning the city or any other activity because it requires funding from the government and the current government of Imran Khan who is the current Prime Minister of Pakistan, has changed all the systems of local governments and others (Jabeen, 2018). It is the primary reason for no-governance in Sindh according to the current situation. On contrary to this, past conflicts between political parties like PMLN and PPP has also impacted the governance as well as practices of the local governments in Sindh (Murtaza et al., 2016; Siddiqui and Safi, 2019; Akbar, 2018; Ghanghro, Phulpoto and Memon, 2016).

On contrary to this, the study of Jabeen (2018), had defined that the current Prime Minister of Pakistan namely 'Imran Khan', has always been the biggest supporter of the local government system. From the study of Jabeen (2018), it has determined that; from the views and interview of Imran Khan, it was reported that the current government is in favour of the local government system through providing governance to the different people within the designation of local governments. On the other side, the study of Murtaza (2017), had defined that the main purpose of the local government system in Sindh, is to provide as well as maintain a properly organised system where people like councillors perform actions to engage the whole activities or surrounding environment as a part of their duty. Local government system governance is liable to perform their practices regarding the improvements of social, economic and the overall environment to give benefits, safety and security to the society or state. It is true that local governments which strong ensure provision of the overall quality of the individual's life and must fulfil their commitments (Idris, 2016; Khan, Rehman and Ashfaq, 2016; Brown and Ahmed, 2016; Nadeem, 2016; Rid and Murtaza, 2019).

### **3.1 Local Government Act of 2013**

Local government Act 2013 of Sindh particularly is based on the local government ordinance, 1979 also follows the local government as well as it includes a metropolitan corporation, district municipal corporation in the Karachi city, district councils, municipal and town committees etc.

## **4. Major Findings**

#### **4.1 Political party system in Sindh makes the implementation of Local governments more difficult**

From the above section of this research study, it has analysed that the political party system in Sindh had made it impossible to implement appropriate activities or the political system based on party system in Sindh, has made the implementation of LG much more difficult (Jabeen, 2018). Initially, much more conflicts which occurred due to PPP and the other nationalist parties like MQM has become very controversial and criticised the LG system made by Musharraf's and according to the study of Jabeen (2018), the Musharraf's LGO system opposed initially in Sindh province but the leadership of Sindh was in the hands of PPP which considered it as a precursor administrative division of Sindh.

#### **4.2 Lacking in the Capability of building local officials**

The studies of (Idris); Khan, Rehman and Ashfaq, (2016); Brown and Ahmed, (2016); Nadeem, (2016); Rid and Murtaza, (2019), had defined that the local government in Sindh, has to lack of the capability of building local officials or the local appointed officials are not elected fairly. They are not well equipped with required skills and abilities which are necessary to run the important operations within the different cities or geographic areas of Sindh. Local officials are not well-aware about policymaking, its evaluation and implementation (Murtaza, 2017). Most of the cases in Sindh include decentralisation which shows the effect from specific date but without the preparedness tactics or practices of the local governments of Sindh in order to push forward the mandate of decentralisation only (Jabeen, 2018). According to the study of Jabeen (2018), it was reported that decentralisation must be introduced in the phased manner to increase the institutional capacity of the local governments in Sindh and to make adjustments simultaneously according to the emerging challenges. In this regard, the central authority in contribution with the local governments' system is liable to formulate the policy of decentralisation to devise the mechanism of the capacity building among the local governments of Sindh (Idris, 2016).

The local government of Sindh needs training related to various important practices to improve the governance system of the local government (Idris, 2016). The local officials need training from the different resources like; from nationals, private and from overseas training institutions.

#### **4.3 Administrative Responsibility**

It is true that in some cases, local governments have restricted power or control to the motivation of the developed personnel for discharging administrative responsibilities to any other administrative staff (Khan, Rehman and Ashfaq, 2016). Therefore government thus should give the powers to the local government to ensure the accountability in form of the written annual confidential reports while imposing some penalties through transfers and recommending suspension (Brown and Ahmed, 2016; Nadeem, 2016).

#### **4.4 Provision of user charges**

The study of Jabeen (2018), had critically defined that the economic efficiency of the local governments enhances the quality and the service delivery. It happens in the situation when citizens user charges for certain services. It means citizens also play the most roles in making the practices of local government efficient (Murtaza, 2017). By paying the charges to the local

governments, citizens can enjoy high-quality services and will also become able to better judge and further accommodate the local demands.

#### **4.5 Governance Model**

The study of Murtaza (2017), had defined that local government works along with the contribution as well as the cooperation of people. Thus the effectiveness of the local governments in Sindh can improve significantly by involving the local communities in local officials (Jabeen, 2018). It implies that a **participatory governance model** could enhance and maximise the governance of the local governments and their services in Sindh. In addition to this, likewise, the study of Idris (2016), explained that adoption of mechanisms such that decentralisation which includes the proper functioning of the central government and empowering the local authority with the effective voice, could enhance the involvement of local government in almost all the sections of state or society in Sindh province.

For the purpose of enhancing participation and collaboration, the study of Khan, Rehman and Ashfaq (2016), had defined that the establishment of decentralisation in the Sindh province can help stakeholders to participate in the integral practices of the decentralisation policy.

#### **4.6 Fiscal discipline**

Local governments in most of the parts of Sindh is facing is suffering from the inadequate resources and the fiscal discipline (Idris, 2016; Khan, Rehman and Ashfaq, 2016; Brown and Ahmed, 2016; Nadeem, 2016; Rid and Murtaza, 2019). The study of Nadeem (2016), in this regard, has presented more critical insights according to which, local government in Sindh is facing financial hardships in form of underfunding and fund diversion is impacting the quality of services along with the diminishing accessibility (Brown and Ahmed, 2016). Due to the financial crisis of faced by the local government in Sindh, the government is accountable to enhance the resources and to generate the revenues capacity of local government (Idris, 2016; Khan, Rehman and Ashfaq, 2016; Brown and Ahmed, 2016; Nadeem, 2016; Rid and Murtaza, 2019).

#### **4.7 Result/Conclusion**

From the overall practices of the local governments in Sindh, it concludes that local government of Sindh is facing crisis situation as well as challenges due to the critical behaviour of individuals and other private, nationals etc. Therefore, the government must provide access to the capital market for the long-term finance as well as for the infrastructure development following the proper regulatory principles. It clears that the practice of strict fiscal discipline is necessary to manage the practices of the local government system and their governance.

#### **References**

- Akbar, N., 2018. Commonwealth Local Government Forum's support of Local Councils Associations in Pakistan. *Commonwealth Journal of Local Governance*, pp.ID-6727.
- Brown, A. and Ahmed, S., 2016. Local government dissolution in Karachi: chasm or catalyst?. *Third World Thematics: A TWQ Journal*, 1(6), pp.879-897.

- Ghanghro, A., Phulpoto, A.S. and Memon, A.A., 2016. Polio eradication initiatives, a critical data analysis, District Khairpur, Sindh Pakistan, 2014. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 45, pp.224-225.
- Glesne, C., 2016. *Becoming qualitative researchers: An introduction*. Pearson. One Lake Street, Upper Saddle River, New Jersey 07458.
- Idris, S., 2016. Challenge of democracy and local governance in Pakistan. In *Comparative studies and regionally-focused cases examining local governments* (pp. 259-279). IGI Global.
- Jabeen, N., 2018. Gender and local governance in Pakistan. In *Women in Governing Institutions in South Asia* (pp. 285-304). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.
- Kalia, S., *Provincial Local Government Systems of Pakistan; A Comparative Perspective*. Department of Architecture & Planning, NED University of Engineering & Technology, City Campus Maulana Din Muhammad Wafai Road, Karachi., p.8.
- Khan, A., Rehman, A.U. and Ashfaq, S., 2016. Centre-Periphery Relations and Governance Gap: The Role of Local Government in Post-Conflict North-Western Pakistan. *J. Appl. Environ. Bio. Sci*, 6(3), pp.186-193.
- Malik, N. and Rana, A., 2019. The History of Local Governance in Pakistan: What Lessons to Learn?. *Journal of International Politics*, 1(3), pp.26-35.
- Mays, N. and Pope, C., 2020. Quality in qualitative research. *Qualitative research in health care*, pp.211-233.
- Murtaza, N. and Pakistan, I.N.S.P.I.R.I.N.G., 2017. *Undermining Local Governance: A Review of the Sindh Local Government System, 2013*. Karachi: Pakistan Institute of Labour Education & Research.
- Murtaza, N., Pakistan, I.N.S.P.I.R.I.N.G., Rid, S.A., Laraib, M. and Naqvi, Z., 2016. Local governance in the federal capital: A review of the 2015 Islamabad local government system.
- Nadeem, M., 2016. Analyzing good governance and decentralization in developing countries. *Journal of Political Sciences and Public Affairs*, 4(3), pp.209-220.
- Rid, S.A. and Murtaza, N., 2019. The Local Government System In Sindh: A Critical Analysis Of The Sindh Local Government Act 2013. *The Government-Annual Research Journal of Political Science.*, 7(7).
- Siddiqui, S. and Safi, M.W.A., 2019. Assessing the Socio-Economic and Environmental Impacts of 2014 Drought in District Tharparkar, Sindh-Pakistan. *International Journal of Economic and Environmental Geology*, pp.8-15.
- Woods, M., Paulus, T., Atkins, D.P. and Macklin, R., 2016. Advancing qualitative research using qualitative data analysis software (QDAS)? Reviewing potential versus practice in published studies using ATLAS. ti and NVivo, 1994–2013. *Social Science Computer Review*, 34(5), pp.597-617.