

## PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt / Egyptology

### IMPLEMENTATION OF THE POLICY TO OPERATE BUS ASSISTANCE OF PATRIOT TRANS IN REALIZING SUSTAINABLE PUBLIC TRANSPORT IN BEKASI CITY WEST JAVA INDONESIA

*Bambang Istianto*<sup>1</sup>, *Wijianto*<sup>2</sup>, *Sulistyo Sutanto*<sup>3</sup>, *Nico Djajasinga*<sup>4</sup>, *Subarto*<sup>5</sup>, *Paisal Halim*<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1,2,3,4,5</sup>Politeknik Transportaasi Darat Indonesia STTD, Indonesia

<sup>6</sup>Pascasarjana, Universitas Nasional, Jakarta, Indonesia

E-mail:<sup>1</sup>[bambang.istianto@ptdisttd.ac.id](mailto:bambang.istianto@ptdisttd.ac.id), <sup>2</sup>[wijianto@ptdisttd.ac.id](mailto:wijianto@ptdisttd.ac.id),

<sup>3</sup>[sulistyosutanto@ptdisttd.ac.id](mailto:sulistyosutanto@ptdisttd.ac.id), <sup>4</sup>[nicodjajasinga@ptdisttd.ac.id](mailto:nicodjajasinga@ptdisttd.ac.id)

<sup>5</sup>[Subarto@ptdisttd.ac.id](mailto:Subarto@ptdisttd.ac.id), <sup>6</sup>[paisalhalim@civitas.unas.ac.id](mailto:paisalhalim@civitas.unas.ac.id)

**Bambang Istianto, Wijianto, Sulistyo Sutanto, Nico Djajasinga, Subarto, Paisal Halim. Implementation Of The Policy To Operate Bus Assistance Of Patriot Trans In Realizing Sustainable Public Transport In Bekasi City West Java Indonesia— Palarch's Journal Of Archaeology Of Egypt/Egyptology 18(3), 512-524. ISSN 1567-214x**

**Keywords: Policy Implementation, Public Transportation, Sustainable Transportation**

#### ABSTRACT

Providing public transport bus assistance to the Bekasi City government is to support an effective urban transport arrangement. Sufficient resources, efficient bus operation institutions, adequate transportation infrastructure, and effective control help the increase in the capacity of public transport services. The purpose of the study is to analyze the extent to which policy implementation has been significant. The theoretical basis used in analyzing policy implementation is the implementation indicator initiated by Edward III. The research method uses qualitative research based on descriptive analysis. Data collection techniques are using documentation techniques and in-depth interviews. Researchers use the triangulation method to analyze data based on information from selected key informants. The results show that the implementation of the Patriot Trans bus operational policy is not yet effective. It is indicated that the routes that have been determined are not suitable for the needs of the community. The Patriot Trans buses, which are managed by a regional owned enterprise, still can operate with government subsidies, as it is not profitable yet. However, if there are no management changes, the service will stop running. For this reason, the central government needs to harmonize its policies to the technical procedures of the regional governments, such as determining precise and accurate routes, adequate road infrastructure, and competent and professional fleet management. The goal is to guarantee the long-term operational continuity of the Patriot Trans.

## INTRODUCTION

Bekasi City, as a buffer city for DKI Jakarta, is facing a complex urban transportation problem, namely public transportation whose fleet conditions are not yet comfortable. Also, many routes are still not suitable for the needs of the community, so it is less desirable. In line with the existing conditions, the central government issued a policy of providing public transportation bus assistance to local governments. The purpose of the system is to assist the regions in structuring urban public transport transportation. The Bekasi City Government was chosen to receive assistance, which is expected to be a stimulus for the community to be more interested in taking more comfortable public transportation.

Based on data from the Bekasi City Transportation Agency in 2017, researchers found that the number of private two-wheeled and four-wheeled vehicles was 1,256,639 and 12,561, respectively, and the number of public transportation was 2,965 thousand, consisting of large buses, medium buses, and small cars. Thus, the number of public transit was 4.37% of the total number of private vehicles, both two-wheeled and four-wheeled. No wonder it has become a standard view that the roads in Bekasi City are filled with personal vehicles. As a consequence, people cannot avoid daily traffic congestion.

Currently, the Bekasi City government has operated aid buses in the Bekasi city area, which have only been effective in 2018. The Patriot Trans bus operation is arranged in three routes. First, the route from Wisma Asri housing estate, which is in the northern area of Bekasi, to Sumber Arta Kalimalang, which is in the southern region of Bekasi. Second, the route from the Harapan Indah housing complex in the western area of Bekasi to the Bekasi City Bus Terminal in the eastern part of Bekasi. Third, buses from Sumarecon Housing in the Central Business District (CBD) of Bekasi City to Vida Bantar Gebang in the East Bekasi area. The three routes are considered representative.

Various series of activities in the implementation effort include the preparation of further regulations, which are interpretations of the formulated policies. The implementation of crafted rules is similar to the issuance of law, followed by the emergence of several Government Regulations, Presidential Decrees, and Regional Regulations. Another activity is preparing resources to drive implementation of a regulation, such as facilities and infrastructure, financial resources, the person in charge of implementing a policy, and how to deliver the policy directly to the community (Suparno, 2013).

The Bekasi City Government realizes that managing and operating public transportation faces complex challenges and obstacles. The management of public transit in business is less profitable, meaning that it is not balanced between operating costs and income. The problem of the research is that the routes have not met the needs of the community. Likewise, the management of

public transport vehicles has not been handled by competent and professional managers. Therefore, there are three questions in this research. First, the extent to which the policy of providing public transport bus assistance to the Bekasi City government is right on target. Second, what factors become obstacles to implementation so that the policy does not achieve its targets. The third question is how to evaluate the performance of the policy to provide public transport bus assistance to the Bekasi City government.

The purpose of this research is to find out more deeply whether the implementation of the aid policy is useful as a target group, namely public transport users in the Bekasi City area.

## CONCEPT AND THEORY APPROACHES

### *Public transportation*

The definition of public transportation is a passenger transportation service by a group travel system available for use by the general public. Generally, it is managed based on schedule, operated on a defined route, and charged for each trip. Public transportation in metropolitan-class cities in developed countries, such as Europe, England, Germany, Japan, and South Korea, has become the mainstay of its citizens' carrying out their daily activities. According to Wendel (1996) in Istianto (2011), the main problem in big cities is traffic jams on the highway. However, if public transportation is efficient and effective, congestion can be cleared up well. Cox, Wendel (1996) in Istianto (2011) states that for many years public transport authorities have extended the theoretical (ability) of public transport to accomplish the importance of public policy and objectives of reducing traffic congestion, air pollution, and energy consumption. Sun Seung Han (2010) in Istianto (2017) says that private car-dependent transport is popular because of the symbolic status. Freedom and privacy and the lack of capabilities in the public sector to invest in public transport infrastructure.

Han (2010) argues that people still like to use private vehicles as a symbol of status and feel they have privacy. The trend may be due to low investment policies in the public sector, especially for public transport infrastructure. For this reason, the procedure for providing bus assistance is following the thoughts of Wendel and Han above.

### *Public policy theory*

Public policy theory recognizes the concept of the policy cycle, starting from policy formulation, implementation, and evaluation of policies. The evaluation results become the input to improve systems and become material for the formulation, then return to the cycle. It means that if the policy implementation results are not following the policy plan, a policy evaluation will be carried out. The three stages, namely formulation, implementation, and evaluation, each have a strategic position that becomes an independent study.

Therefore, the three steps are an ongoing cycle. Thus the policy process is not only about policy implementation, but the evaluation stage must be carried out. Here, the performance of the policy for providing transportation bus assistance needs to be evaluated so that it can be seen whether the results are following the policy plan. Nugraha (2011) says the program itself is 20% of the success, implementation is 60%, and the remaining 20% is how we control execution.

According to Winarno (2007), the term policy may be used broadly, such as in Indonesian economic policy and Japanese monetary policy. Also, it may be used to be something more specific, such as if we say government policies on reducing procedures and deregulation.

### *Implementation theory*

Implementation is an action of a plan that has been prepared carefully and in detail. Implementation is usually done after planning is considered perfect. According to Usman (2002), it boils down to activities, actions, or the existence of a system mechanism. It is not just an activity, but an activity that is planned to achieve the objectives. Setiawan (2004) argues that implementation is the expansion of activities that mutually adjust the interaction process between goals and actions to achieve them and requires a significant network of implementers, bureaucracy.

Suparno (2013) provides a definition related to implementation, namely part of the public policy process, in addition to the previous stages of agenda-setting, formulation, adoption, and the phases after assessment. What is meant by policy implementation is the ability to form further relationships in a series of causes and effects that link actions with goals.

The implementation of policies related to public policies also has specific conditions. The requirements for being able to implement policies correctly according to Brian W. Hogwood's Implementation Theory and Lewis A. Gun in Solichin (1997), namely:

- a. External conditions faced by the implementing agency will not experience serious problems or obstacles. The obstacles may be physical, political, and so on.
- b. There are sufficient time and resources for program implementation.
- c. The necessary mix of resources is readily available.
- d. The policies to be implemented are based on a reliable causality relationship.
- e. The causality relationship is direct, and there are only a few links in the chain of connection.
- f. Small interdependent relationship.
- g. Deep understanding and agreement towards goals.
- h. Tasks are listed and placed in the proper order.
- i. Perfect communication and coordination.

j. Those in power can demand perfect obedience.

The implementation of public policies has been embedded in a Government Regulation, Presidential Decree, or Regional Regulation. The government, especially regional governments, has local autonomy to carry out a public policy implementation to provide rules related to regulations that have been formulated. In implementing the decentralization or regional autonomy policy, the government has set several approaches to improve services to the community in the regions. One of the systems in this regard is service activities in the field of licensing, namely the implementation of public bus transportation in the Regional Government.

According to Edward III's view in Ismail (2009), policy implementation is influenced by four indicators, namely:

a. Communication, namely the successful implementation of policies, requires that implementers know what to do, what are the goals, and policy targets that must be transmitted to the target group (target group) so that it will reduce the distortion of implementation.

b. Resources are an essential part. Even though the content of the policy has been communicated clearly and consistently, but the implementor lacks the resources to implement it, the implementation will not be sufficient. The resources can be in the form of human resources, for example, the competence of implementers and financial resources.

c. Disposition is the character and characteristics possessed by the implementor. If the implementor has a good disposition, then the implementor can carry out policies well. Edward III states that the attitude of the implementer sometimes causes problems if the perspective is different from that of the policymaker. Therefore, it can consider or pay attention to aspects of employee placement (executor) and incentives to anticipate.

d. Bureaucratic structure is an arrangement of components or work units in an organization that shows a division of labor and clarity on how different functions or activities are integrated or coordinated. Besides, a bureaucratic structure that is not too long will facilitate the implementation of supervision.

Evaluation of Rural Transportation Service Policy in GunungKidul Regency, which is a research conducted by Effendi (2007), and Evaluation of Transportation Policy to Reduce Congestion in DKI Jakarta, by IdrusChairinsyahAtmojo (2014), are included in this study. It is intended to determine and compare the findings of research results to prove or applied theory. Thus it can inform the need for similar research to be followed by changes in theoretical and methodological approaches.

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

In terms of its approach, the research is classified as a descriptive study which only describes and summarizes various conditions and situations within a

certain period. It is intended to define internal and external environmental factors without intending to draw general conclusions (Creswell, 1944). According to Sekaran (2009: 158), descriptive research is carried out to identify and explain the characteristics of the variables being studied in a situation. This research approach uses a case study approach.

According to Sekaran and Bougie (2013), case study research aims to identify, understand, and describe the characteristics of humans, events, or situations that are the focus of research. Also, descriptive analysis can help to think systematically about aspects of a particular case, provide ideas for further investigation, and simplify certain decisions. The study does not test hypotheses or explain relationships. In the study, researchers used a case study approach method. So, the authors compare the data that is equipped with information sources.

The location of the research is in Bekasi City for public transport users. The research period was two months, starting from June to July 2020.

### *Data collection techniques*

Data collection techniques used in the study are interviews, observations, and documentation of the Bekasi City Government. According to Sugiyono (2015: 231), an interview is a meeting of two people to exchange information and ideas through questions and answer so that meaning can be constructed in a particular topic. Meanwhile, documentation is a data collection technique using documents or archives owned by the parties concerned with the research.

The next stage is the determination of informants. According to Sugiyono (2015), sampling must be determined in advance for a specific purpose in a qualitative approach. Selection for the research object was carried out using purposive sampling, namely the sampling technique with consideration or subjective research from the researcher. So, here, the researcher determines which respondents are considered to represent the population. In this study, the research informants were as follows:

- a. Directorate General of Land Transportation: 1 Person.
- b. Transportation Agency: 2 Person.
- c. PD Mitra Trans Bus Company (Patriot Trans) Manager: 2 Person.
- d. Public Vehicle Entrepreneurs Organization: 2 Person
- e. Bekasi City Transportation Council: 1 Person.
- f. Bekasi City Environment and Transportation Observer: 1 person.

### *Data analysis techniques*

There are three methods of data analysis. The first is inductive data analysis, which is a general analysis method based on the results of interviews with interpretations and conclusions drawn. The second method is the results of in-depth interviews using triangulation analysis, namely analyzing the results of

the interview from three different points of view. The analysis of primary data obtained from in-depth interviews was carried out using triangulation techniques, namely analysis of the same questions and answers from key informants who had significant levels of variation and diversity.

### *Data validity test*

The last stage is the data validity test. There are four criteria: credibility, trust, dependability, and confirmability to test the validity of the data.

## **RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

### *Implementation of the Use of Public Transport Bus Assistance to Local Governments*

#### *Implementation Indicators*

##### *Communication*

One of the indicators of implementation is communication. It is one of the indicators that require the implementor to know what to do, where the objectives and policy targets must be transmitted to the target group to reduce the distortion of implementation.

Based on information from the Regional Company Mitra Patriot, Division Head Nirwan Fauzi (2018), who monitors the number of passengers in the second week after the operation of the 2018 Patriot Trans bus, it was stated that:

The number of Patriot Trans passengers continues to increase, from the initial 11-12 passengers per trip to 22 passengers. The number of passengers is more during the day until it reaches 100 passengers. It is possible that during their working hours, they prefer other transportation. The target passengers for one trip are 30 passengers. Our target is still the same: 30 passengers at the end of December 2018. If we reach the target, the passenger will be charged the ideal rate of Rp.7.000 for one trip. The government provides a subsidy of Rp. 3,500 so that the community pays only Rp.3,500 per trip.

Furthermore, monitoring the number of passengers in February 2020, the number of passengers was still 4 to 5 passengers or 15% only (source; beritasatu.com, February 3, 2020). Concerning the data above, a limited survey was carried out on three routes on July 1, 2020. Data from the survey are listed in the table below.

**Table:** Number of Trans Patriot Bus Passengers

| No | Number of passengers per trip      |    |    |     | Total passenger | Passenger Capacity |
|----|------------------------------------|----|----|-----|-----------------|--------------------|
|    | Transport routes                   | I  | II | III |                 |                    |
| 1  | Harapan Indah-Terminal Kota Bekasi | 17 | 15 | 16  | 48              | 126                |
| 2. | WismaAsri-SumberArtha              | 13 | 11 | 11  | 35              | 126                |
| 3. | CBD Sumarecon - Vida BtrGebang     | 12 | 11 | 10  | 33              | 126                |

**Source:** The survey data is processed in 2020.

The data shows that during the early days of the New Normal, the load factor for the route of Harapan Indah - Bekasi City Terminal is 38.09%. It illustrates that the load factor during the New Normal period only reached about 38 - 39% of the available capacity. The illustration also shows that the public still does not feel completely safe using public transportation during the New Normal due to the Covid-19 pandemic. For the WismaAsri - SumberArtha route, the load factor only reaches about 27 - 28% of the available capacity. Meanwhile, the Summarecon - Vida BantarGebang route is around 26.10%. It explains that the load factor is still deficient; ideally, maintaining the operational continuity, the load factor service has to reach 60-70%.

Based on the data from different periods, namely load factor information on December 17, 2018, the number of passengers was 11-12 passengers per trip and increased to 22 passengers. While the survey conducted on July 1, 2020, shows that the number of passengers was still under 30 passengers. Therefore, considering that the number of passengers is still below 30 passengers each time, the revenue generated by passengers has not been able to cover operational costs according to the data mentioned above.

The central government, through the Directorate General of Land Transportation, assisted 20 bus fleets to the Bekasi city government. According to information sourced from key informant WahyuHapsoro from the Directorate General of Land Transportation that:

The policy of providing BRT (bus rapid transit) city bus assistance to Bekasi City is an implementation of the Public Transport Development Program, which is the responsibility of the central government. The BekasiCity Government, which was selected to receive BRT assistance, was deemed eligible. The requirements area big city; there is no adequate urban public transportation available, the Bekasi City Government is willing to prepare its institutions, human resources, and operational budgets. (interview result to

WahyuHapsoro from the Directorate General of Land Transportation, July 8, 2020).

As for the arrangement of public transportation in Bekasi City and the provision of Patriot Trans bus assistance, according to the information key from Bekasi City Environment and Transportation Observer Tengku Imam Qobul (2020), who is also the Director of Sapulidi NGO:

It is responding to the provision of bus assistance Patriot Trans. First, the designated route needs to be evaluated because it is not following the needs of the Bekasi City community. Second, passengers tend to switch to other types of transportation because the waiting time is quite long, which exceeds the target time (headway) of 15 minutes. Third, actually, the government can integrate the bus assistance with the conversion program to replace existing, unsuitable transportation. Fourth, along with the conversion program, it must be followed by road widening, including city, provincial, and national roads that are passed by the Patriot Trans bus route, so that a particular route can be made for the Patriot Trans. Fifth, transportation management in the form of an agency. Regional businesses must be managed professionally and reliably so that the operational sustainability of vehicles is guaranteed.

In its development, the current number of Patriot Trans bus passengers has still not reached the ideal target of 30 passengers in one trip. However, only about 15% or 4 or 5 passengers have been fulfilled per one trip (source: beritasatu.com, February 3, 2020).

The Bekasi City Government has increased the Trans Patriot fleet to 29 units. The addition follows the assistance of 20 medium-sized buses from the Ministry of Transportation, which were received at the end of December 2018 (source: tempo.com, January 3, 2019).

Responses and information from key informants, and various secondary data sources, from communications in the field of utilization and urban transportation arrangement in Bekasi City, have the same views regarding the need for more severe handling of transportation facilities and infrastructure for the Bekasi City Government. The government needs to develop urban transportation planning and programs that are integrated and synergistic with related sectors to produce sustainable urban transportation arrangements. The government needs to create a better route and road infrastructure that supports the smooth journey of Patriot Trans buses according to the designated headway, which is 15 minutes. Headway improvements can support the load factor increases to reach 60 to 70%. With this arrangement, the implementation of urban public transportation in the Bekasi City area will run more sustainably.

### ***Resources***

One indicator of successful implementation is resources. Even though the content of the policy has been communicated clearly and consistently, if the implementor lacks the resources to implement it, the performance will not be sufficient. The resources can be in the form of human resources, for example, the competence of implementers and financial resources.

According to Hotman Pane (2020), a key informant from the Public Transportation Vehicle Entrepreneurs Organization:

The number of vehicles has decreased. The number of public transports currently operating is 3200 fleets and has reduced to between 1500 and 2000. The reduction in vehicles is due to competition with online vehicles, both four-wheeled and two-wheeled. The operation of the Patriot Trans buses must be supported by broader road conditions so that the Patriot Trans buses can get special lanes such as Trans Jakarta (Result of an interview with the Hotman Pane Public Transportation Vehicle Entrepreneurs Association, August 27, 2020).

Also, there are several secondary data related to the implementation of the use of bus assistance. One of them comes from the Director of PD Mitra TB HENDRA (source Media Indonesia.com, May 2018). Hendra says that the Patriot Trans Bus operated in 2018. At the time of the trial, namely the first day of operation, the number of passengers was 92 people, there were 320 people on the second day, and there were 470 people on the third day.

The results of the study are consistent with direct research that the Patriot Trans bus management faces formidable challenges. Therefore, the management's ability to manage public transport operations is a top priority for the government to fix. The direct survey results show that during the operating period, there is a fluctuation between expenses that are not balanced with the income from the passengers. Load factors that do not reach 60% are not sufficient to cover operational costs, so that the company tends to lose money.

### ***Disposition***

The disposition indicator is the character and characteristics possessed by the implementor. If the implementor has a good disposition, then the implementor can carry out policies well.

The disposition, as stated by the key informant of the Transportation Service, namely Fatikun (2020), is as follows:

Bekasi City is currently growing into a metropolitan city in line with the development of the population that has increased significantly. Therefore, it needs to be balanced with a more comprehensive, integrated, and programmable urban transportation arrangement. For urban transportation management, the first step that must be taken is the rejuvenation of public transport, followed by road infrastructure planning. Therefore, it is necessary

to carry out an in-depth study and cross-sector coordination with related agencies so that the design of the urban transportation system is more substantial (Result of the interview with the Fatikun Transportation Agency, August 25, 2020).

There are secondary data to explore the management of Patriot Trans buses. PD Mita Trans public relations IqbalDaud (Antaranews, 2018) explains several things as follows. First, monthly operational costs of IDR 600 million. Second, the income from tickets, from January to October, is Rp. 1.4 billion. Third, the operating expenditure isRp. 6 billion. Thus, the result is the operating loss ofRp. 4.6 billion. Fourth, in the 2020 budget planning, the government will provide a subsidy for a tariff of Rp.5,500 and an upper tariff of Rp. 11,000, in which the operational implementation will work with third parties. Fifth, the ability of the government to provide subsidies is at a rate of Rp. 3,000 so that the current rate being implemented is Rp. 4,000.

Based on the opinion that has been harmonized with secondary data, the government must determine the number of subsidies regularly by calculating fixed operating costs so that targets can be met. The management has to ensure that the operating cost will not be increased. It is necessary to calculate turnover costs. It means that the government has predicted the operational expenses required according to existing data. As a result, the policies that will be reinstated are related to tariffs so that the determination of subsidies will run smoothly and not suffer too many losses.

### ***Bureaucracy***

The bureaucratic indicator is an arrangement of work components (units) in an organization that shows a division of labor and clarity on how different functions or activities are integrated or coordinated.

The use of urban transportation arrangements according to HarunAlrasyid (2020) of the Bekasi City Transportation Council are:

The assistance of 40 public buses can be used simultaneously with plans for conversion or rejuvenation of city transportation currently not feasible. However, the conversion program must be carried out with careful planning to support the design of a reliable urban transportation system. (Result of the interview with Bekasi City Transportation Council, HarunAlrasyid, August25, 2020) "

It can be explained through extracting information on critical informants to explore the above opinion:

The following information is obtained from the Head of the Trans Patriot Division (source: Warta Kota com, December 17, 2018. At the beginning of the operation, the number of passengers was 11-12 passengers on one trip, and now it has increased to 22 passengers. However, during the daytime, the

number of passengers reaching 100. The target for passengers per day is 30 passengers per day on every single trip.

Based on the discussion of secondary data and primary data above, it can be stated that aid buses can be an entry point for planning urban transportation arrangements in Bekasi City and integrating it with related sectors. City Government has adequate resource support to realize a more solid urban transport arrangement. If the implementation of the route test is carried out more accurately and carefully, it will be strong support for the operation. Likewise, strengthening of corporate governance in a more professional, profit-oriented manner.

## **CONCLUSIONS & SUGGESTIONS**

### ***Conclusion***

The people of Bekasi City give a positive response and support the implementation of the Patriot Trans bus operational policy. However, the community has not fully utilized the aid buses, as evidenced by the load factor below fifty percent (50%). It is indicated that the routes that have been determined are not suitable for the needs of the community. The fact shows that only 46% of the people who always use the aid bus. The management of Patriot Trans buses by BUMD has not delivered any profit but can continue operating with government subsidies. The obstacle to this policy is the failure to align central government policies with regional government technical policies, such as determining the right and exact route, adequate road infrastructure, and competent and professional fleet management. As a result, the targets that had been set are not achieved.

### ***Suggestion***

The bus assistance program policy can still be continued, but with more comprehensive and integral planning with regional systems. Also, the Department of Transportation needs to evaluate routes that provide more feasible prospects so that the operation of Trans Patriot buses is sustainable and profitable. Local governments need to prioritize the development of adequate road infrastructure for Patriot Trans buses. The central government needs to provide a technical guidance package through an incubation model to assist in not just like Santa Claus in every aid to the regions.

### ***Thank you***

It is appropriate to express thanks to all those who helped write this article. Especially to Bekasi City government officials as key informants, officials at PTDI-STTD, officials of the Directorate General of Land Transportation, and public transportation users Patriot Trans who have provided the information needed in completing the writing of this research report.

## REFERENCES

- Creswell, John, (1994) *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Approaches*, Second Edition. Thousand Oak, London, New Delhi Sage publications.
- Grindle, Merilee.S, 1980, *Politics and Policy Implementation The Third World* New Jersey, Princeton University Press
- Istianto, Bambang, (2011) *Government Management in Public Service Perspective*. Issuer: PT. Mitra Discourse Media Jakarta
- Istianto, Bambang (2017) *Online Transportation Policy and Social Conflict*. *Journal of the Asian Association of State Administrative Scientists*. Volume 5, Number 2, October 2017. OJS.
- Nawawi, Ismail. (2009) *Public Policy*. ITS Press. Surabaya.
- Nugraha, Riant. (2011) *Public Policy*. PT. Elex Media Komputindo, Jakarta.
- Patton, Michael Quin, (2002) *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods*, 3rd Edition. Oak, London, New Delhi, Sage Publications.
- Now, Uma.(2009) *Research Methods for Business*. Salemba Empat: Jakarta.
- Now, Uma & Bougie, R. (2013). *Research Methods for Business: A skill. Building Approach*, Issue 5. New York: John Wiley @ Sons.
- Setiawan, Guntur. (2004) *Implementation in the Development Bureaucracy*, Balai Pustaka, Jakarta
- Solichin, A.W. (1997). *Policy analysis, from formulation to implementation of State policy*, Second Edition. Earth Literacy, Jakarta.
- Suparno.(2013) *Implementation of Public Policy in Practice (Implementation of Food Security Policy in Rembang Regency)*, Dwiputra Pustaka Jaya, Sidoarjo.
- Sun Seung Han, (2010) *Land transport Policy and Development In Singapore*, Urban Planning Faculty Architecture. Building and Planning The University Of Melbourne
- Sugiyono.(2015) *Educational Research Methods (Quantitative Approaches, Qualitative and R & D)*. Alfabeta Publisher, Bandung.
- Usman, Nurdin. (2002) *Context of Curriculum-Based Implementation*, Grasindo, Jakarta,
- Winarno, Budi. (2002) *Public Policy Theory and Process*. Yogyakarta; Media Pressindo.

## WEB SITE / INTERNET.

Bisnis.com May 2019.

tirto.id, 2019

antara news (2018)