

PalArch's Journal of Archaeology  
of Egypt / Egyptology

# A COMPARATIVE DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF PAKISTANI ENGLISH AND URDU NEWSPAPERS' HEADLINES

**Aurangzaib**

Research Scholar, Beaconhouse National University, Lahore.  
Email: zaib\_sidhu@hotmail.com

**Dr. Abdul Majid Khan Rana**

Assistant Professor,  
Institute of Education & Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore.

**Dr. Ashi Zeeshan**

Assistant Professor, Institute of Education & Research.  
Email:ashi.ier@pu.edu.pk

**Dr. Syed Abir Hassan Naqvi**

Assistant Professor  
Institute of Education & Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore  
Email: abirhassan.ier@pu.edu.pk

**Aurangzaib, Dr. Abdul Majid Khan Rana, Dr. Ashi Zeeshan, Dr. Syed Abir Hassan Naqvi: A Comparative Discourse Analysis of Pakistani English and Urdu Newspapers' Headlines--Palarch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology 18(4), ISSN 1567-214x**

**Keywords: Newspapers, Media, Press**

## ABSTRACT

The present study aims to explore the discourse presented in the headlines of Pakistani Urdu and English newspaper about a specific news event- Panama Leaks. In this regard, it investigated whether the discourse and the policy of the media is manipulated by the powerful groups of Pakistani society. It has conducted comparative analysis of the discourse of two Urdu and two English Pakistani newspapers' headlines about Panama Leaks. The collected data is analyzed qualitatively in terms of textual and contextual analysis using the tools of page layout, transitivity, word choice, referential strategies (framing), ideological standpoints, and comparative-synchronic analysis. The findings reveal a disparity in the presentation of media event by Urdu and English newspapers. The study found out that media discourse may not always represent public opinion as it may be exploited to support a particular perspective of the government. In contrast, certain newspapers may also use media discourse to expose the real intentions of the government in a particular news event. The study suggests that it is necessary to expose this exploitation to avoid the manipulation of public opinion and also to provide people with an unbiased and fair news information.

**Keywords:** Newspapers, Media, Press

## INTRODUCTION

In 21<sup>st</sup> century, media being the fourth pillar of a state possesses a potential power in any society (Thomas & Wareing, 1999, and Nani, 2003). Media has also made this world a global village where information about any

worldly affair is just a click away (Crystal, 1993). Media, especially the press, is responsible for disseminating information about various local, national and international events (Nani, 2003). It is said that media may control and sale the information (Richardson, 2007). Mass media shapes public opinion as it is the most powerful force of a society (Islam et.al, 2015, Carvehlo, 2008, &Van Dijk, 1999). It has also become a fast-growing industry which holds the power to turn the black into white and white into black. It is the foremost tool to trigger social, economic and political waves (Chadwick, 2017 and Nani, 2003).

Language is the center through which an event is presented or described. Language is not considered mere a tool to interpret the reality rather it is also a mean to construct the reality (Taiwoo, 2007). Therefore, linguists (see Lee, 1992; Simpson, 1993) analyze the language of the news media and try to find out the relationship between a story and its context. Broadly speaking, the function of every newspaper language is to inform and entertain people but the language used in the newspaper is different from the language of business or academia (Timuçin, 2010). The language of newspaper even varies from newspaper to newspaper and sometimes from news story to story. According to Crystal and Davy (1969: 173), linguistic homogeneity can never be found in newspaper writing as a newspaper is always stylistically eclectic. A striking fact is the difference of overall styles of journalists to deal the same issue (Crystal & Davy, 1969).

Thus, in this study we are going to analyze how the linguistic choices create difference in a news story and how the same news is presented differently by newspapers' headlines e.g. Urdu and English. Every newspaper may present a totally different version of the same story because of the selection of different linguistic choices, style and structure. In this study, comparative analysis of Urdu and English newspapers' headlines, related to the national issue "Panama Leaks Scandal", has been conducted.

### **Discourse and Media**

The word discourse means the study of the language in use (Gee, 2010). A statement without any purpose cannot be called as discourse (Gee, 2010). Fairclough (2003) and Johnstone (2018) define discourse (written or spoken) as a way to highlight different relations of the people to the external world may it be political, economic, social, or religious. On the other hand, discourse analysis means the cues and clues used by a speaker or writer to shape readers' or listeners' interpretations and actions (Gee, 2010). Broadly speaking, the relationship between discourse (written or spoken) and media (print or electronic) is strong enough to attract linguists' attention.

### **Critical Discourse Analysis**

According to Van Dijk (1999), critical discourse analysis (CDA) is the study of social practices through which social power, dominance and inequality is being practiced or sometimes resisted through written or spoken text. Its purpose is to expose the hidden agendas behind every written or spoken discourse. According to Carvalho (2008), the goal of the CDA is to look beyond the text by taking into account the context (institutional and socio-cultural). In terms of the study of media discourse, CDA is the only approach to conduct the research (Carvahlo, 2008). Carvahlo (2008) further argues that CDA researchers try to create a relationship between the text and the social practice. Their main concern is to find how people shape, produce and reproduce views about the world through the use of the language (Johnstone, 2018). In this study we have employed CDA to analyze the print media discourse by using AnabelaCarvahlo's (2008) theoretical model which is mainly proposed for the journalistic discourse where written language is dominant.

### **The Language of Newspapers' Headlines**

Headline is one of the most distinctive features of a newspaper as it highlights the creativity of the journalists (Crystal, 1993). The success of the newspaper lies in the formation of headlines as most of the people scan only the headlines (Crystal, 1993). Headlines determine the readability and popularity of the articles of the newspaper as they are the most important representation of journalistic style (Rich, 2010, p. 259). We can say that the author and the reader interact and communicate with each other through the medium of headlines of the newspaper (Bitiniene, 2007, p. 62). Therefore, headline writers must be experts in their skills (Don and Simpson, 2002).

Straumann (1935, cited inKhodabandeh, 2007) referred to the language of headline as "Block Language" and classified it into nominal, verbal, neutral, and particles. Mardh (1980) has also classified the headlines on similar lines. Structurally, verbal headlines and non-verbal headlines are two broad categories (Yadegarfar, 2014). Verbal headlines possess verbal clause with verb as head word whereas non-verbal headlines do not possess verbal clause but nominal phrase where noun works as head word (Yadegarfar, 2014). The language of headline is a complete

autonomous language with its own rules where syntax deviates considerably from the core grammar (Straumann, 1935, cited in Khodabandeh, 2007).

Brisau (1969) also found that most of the headlines contain complex clauses. Reah (1998) says that omission is an indispensable feature of the newspaper headlines. Omission of some open words and mostly closed words is also found to ensure the brevity of the headlines (Turner, 1972, p.72). Omission of articles, nominal phrases, use of present tense, omission of conjugation and extensive use of metaphors are also common features of headlines (Mardh, 1980 and Van Dijk, 1988).

Functionally, headlines are mainly formed to give the essence of the news story as it presents the crux of the complicated news story in limited words (Ungerer, 2000). Headlines arise curiosity and provide quick and accurate information (Ungerer, 2000: p.48). A newspaper performs its communicative act through headlines (Tiawo, 2007). The communicative function of the headline is to build the relevance between news story and the reader (Dor, 2003; p. 696). Headlines are used to sustain, to initiate and to shape the news discourse (Tiawo, 2007; p.244). The major function of the headlines is to introduce, to express, and to summarize the topic (Van Dijk, 1988:53). Some headlines give the function of the abstract of the complete news story and some headlines perform the function of promoting the detail of the news story (Bell, 1991 and Nir, 1993). But Lindemann (1990, cited in Bonyadi, 2012) propagates that headlines can also perform the function of complex riddles other than just summarizing or giving detail of the news story. Headlines are "miniature replica" of the main story. Its face value, in short and easy wording, attracts the reader's attention (Bird and Merwin, 1955:177 cited in Majeed et.al, 2012). The true potential of any headline is to draw and to captivate the reader's attention and this attention further extends the interest of the reader to read the complete article (Siposova, 2011). As headlines force the reader to read the article, we can say it is the sole reason behind the overall sale of a newspaper (Siposova, 2011). In short, some important functions of newspaper headlines are to attract the reader, to persuade the reader, to arise the curiosity of the reader, to give crux of the news story, to summarize the news and to give accurate information in no time and space.

### **Selection of the Text/Newspapers**

We have selected two English language (The Dawn and Daily Times) and two Urdu language (Jang, and The Express) newspapers of Pakistan. The rationale behind their selection is their wide and large circulation. There are around 1052 dailies in Pakistan but these newspapers have prestige of wide circulation (ABC, report, 2015; cited in Lubna, 2015). Furthermore, these newspapers are considered influential and persuasive in Pakistani society (Kheeshadeh, 2012; Malik & Iqbal, 2011; Shoeb, 2008: cited in Lubna, 2015). Simply, they are the paradigms where national thinking revolves. They are not alike in their ideologies and representation of the news because of their different schools of thought (Shoeb, 2008). English newspapers are left of center whereas Urdu newspapers are right of center (Shoeb, 2008). Thus, our research is going to probe that how contrarily both the newspapers represent the same news event Panama Leaks.

### **Selection of the News Event**

Major socio-economic and political issue of Pakistan since its creation is corruption (Farooq et. al, 2013). Recently, in April 2016, the world's biggest Leaks in the history, named Panama Leaks, has revealed the off shore companies of some iconic personalities of the world. It has been revealed from the database of world's fourth biggest offshore law firm Mossack Fonseca (Betz, 2017 and Malik, 2016). Many Pakistani politicians are also named in these papers and the most prominent is Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and his family (Malik, 2016). Within no time, the issue has caught the attention of the print as well as electronic media. The bigger the magnitude of the news, the more the people will take interest in it. Therefore, the sole reason to select this issue is its magnitude and the response from the people who has taken interest in this issue. Moreover, it is a national issue which can better reveal the ideological stance of media.

### **Research Questions**

Here are some major research questions which would be answered in this study.

- What linguistic and discursive strategies have been employed in Pakistani newspapers headlines to present the news event of Panama Leaks?
- What are the linguistic differences and similarities of these newspapers' headlines?
- How the print media discourse headlines shape and control the ideologies of the masses?

This study is significant because it will help to understand the hidden ideologies behind the newspaper language and the expression of power through media discourse. Further, the present study is limited to the headlines of the first page of selected dailies related to the single news event Panama Leaks.

## RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study is qualitative in nature and has applied critical discourse analysis method to analyze newspaper headlines. Due to the limitations of time and space only one event (Panama Leaks) has been selected. The selection of text is made from a specific time- 4th of April, 2016 to 6th April, 2016 as the Panama scandal was first highlighted in Pakistani media during this period. Headlines are collected from online version of the newspapers. Some data has also been collected from Punjab Public Library in Lahore where its representatives provided us with scanned first pages (from 4th April- 6th April 2016) of The Dawn and The Jang.

An analysis which employs CDA may apply multiple analytical tools to unfold the hidden agendas the media text (Islam et.al, 2015). Anabela Carvehlo's (2008) theoretical model provides us with the analytical tools to conduct analysis at two levels, textual and contextual (Islam et.al, 2015). Unit analysis or textual analysis may include page layout (page number, size of article, visual aids, and makeup of news event), transitivity (simple syntactic analysis of agent and object), referential strategies (ways and means to refer people), discursive strategies (framing; focus of the text), word choice and ideological stand point (see Carvehlo, 2008; Islam et.al, 2015). On the other hand, contextual analysis may include comparative synchronic and historical diachronic analysis (Islam et.al, 2015). Comparative-synchronic Analysis refers to the alternative account or dealing with a particular event or issue at a specific time (see Islam et.al, 2015; Carvehlo, 2008).

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

This analysis of headlines over Panama Issue will provide us with multiple interpretations and philosophies by unfolding the hidden ideologies which an ordinary reader is unable to comprehend.

### Page Layout and Structural Organization

The major English newspaper "The Dawn" has given the coverage to the issue on the very first day (4th April, 2016) of its occurrence at international media. The issue has been allotted the very first page of the newspaper in all three days coverage. Though the position of the news on the page was at bottom of the paper at first day, yet it holds enough space to catch the attention of the readers. The following days exhibit the show by making it a major headline. The maximum coverage is given on 5th of April, 2016 when two headlines are printed. Only once the headline is supported with picture of Prime Minister. Structurally, headlines of the all three days have a lead paragraph which is followed by the whole story. Its coverage shows its neutral policy over the issue.

Another popular English newspaper "Daily Times" has not covered the issue on its very first day but the rest of the two days exhibit the coverage at first page. On sixth of April 2016, it has given maximum coverage with the picture of Prime Minister. Structural organization also follows the said standard. Its coverage and make-up of page layout reflects its neutral policy but the absence of issue in its very first day leaves the impression of pro-government policy to some extent.

The Major Urdu newspaper "The Jang" has given the coverage to the issue from the very first day (4th April, 2016) but it has not made it a main headline. On the very first page, headlines are too small to be seen hardly. Its coverage lacks graphic support. Structurally, it follows the standard. Sometimes a minor statement of a member of the ruling political party has also been given space at first page just to give it unnecessary media hype. It shows its tilt towards the government.

In 'Daily Express', the issue has not found space on its very first day but rest of the days it holds the place on the very first page. Its headlines were bold enough to be seen easily which also have been supported with pictures of the world's iconic personalities as well as Pakistani politicians who were exposed in the Leaks. Its structural organization follows the standard. It has also covered the unnecessary statements of the ruling political leaders.

The page layout reflects that English print media gives routine coverage to the issue whereas Urdu print media has sensationalized the issue in favor of government which is an evident of the control of the government over the Urdu Print media.

## Transitivity

For a comprehensive analysis of any discourse, it is necessary to analyze the series of actions. In addition, it is also important to look at the positive/negative representation of that action for which transitivity is a usual analytical tool. Look at the following headlines from "The Dawn" newspaper;

*"Panama Papers reveal Sharif family's 'offshore holdings'" (The Dawn, April 4, 2016: p. 01).*

*"Offshore holdings of bigwigs exposed" (The Dawn, April 05, 2016: p.01).*

*"Panama Papers reignite row between PTI, PML-N" (The Dawn, April 05, 2016: p.01).*

*"PM announces judicial probe to get sons cleared". (The Dawn, April 06, 2016: p.01).*

If we look at the first three headlines, we will come to know that the editor has tried to adopt neutral policy by creating neutral agents who are "Panama Papers" and "Offshore holdings" whereas "reveal", "exposed" and "reignite" are processes respectively. The object of first headline is Sharif family who has been affected by the Panama revelation. The object of third headline is a "row between PTI, PML-N". In these headlines, a fair representation of the event may be observed where neither an actor nor an object has been given undue importance. These headlines merely highlight the information that country's iconic personalities are in trouble because of offshore companies.

In the last headline, the actor or agent is "Prime Minister" who asks for judicial enquiry about the scandal but the indirect object of the headline is the word "sons" which gives an impression that affected persons are in blood relation to PM. It shows that the editor of the headlines is not at all backing the government in this scandal.

Another English newspaper is "Daily Times" where issue has been discussed.

*"Panama Papers: leak opens Pandora's box in Pakistan". (Daily Times, April 05, 2016: p.01).*

*"Nawaz orders probe into mega leaks" (Daily Times, April 06, 2016: p.01).*

In first headline, "Leak" is an agent and the object is "Pandora's box" whereas process is "open". Here, the neutral agent is portrayed negatively as a new trouble is being reported through this agent. The process refers to a revelation of plethora of troubles which were previously unknown to the country. In the second headline, "Nawaz" is agent who is PM of the country and "probe into mega leaks" is an object whereas the process is an "order". Here the agent is assigned the positive role as Nawaz demands investigation immediately. These headlines are evidence of the biased reporting and are open enough to reckon the tilt of the newspaper towards government.

Now look at some headlines from Urdu newspaper "The Jang".

*"Pakistan k kae siyasatdaan, tajir, sanatkaar berooney mulk companio k maliknikly" (The daily Jang, April 04, 2016: p.01).*

*"Offshore companian meri hain, mehnat ki kamae ha, corruption nahin ki: Hussain Nawaz" (The daily Jang, April 04, 2016: p.01).*

*"paisa karoobar k lie nahan, jilaawatni k doran rehan sehan k lie ley ker gye: Hussain Nawaz". (The daily Jang, April 05, 2016: p.01).*

*"Commission Sharif khandaan samait 250 pakistanio ki tehqqaat kryga" (The daily Jang, April 06, 2016: p.01)*

In the first headline, the agent is not a single person but the whole elite class, the process is the possession of something which was previously unknown whereas the object is the companies (illegal). Here, the newspaper seems to avoid, deliberately, highlighting the ruling family as it includes generic nouns instead of naming important people involved in the scandal. The second and third headlines are explanatory statements of the Prime Minister's son which show that the offshore companies belong to him and he has to work hard to achieve them. Here, the agents are "offshore companies" and "paisa (money) a kind of passive agent" whereas objects are neutral. The sole reason to sensationalize these explanatory statements is to spread a message of innocence of the victim. The last headline is a testimony of an inclusive statement where an agent is "commission (judicial)", the process is to hold investigation, and the object is "Sharif khandaan" and 250 other Pakistanis. In the first and third headlines, the editor seems to generalize the issue merely to divert the focus off the real victims. The editor has mentioned the political elite inclusively along with other affluent segments of the society which reflects its biased pro-government policy.

Look at some headlines from “The Express”.

*“siasatdano ki khufia dolaat: Bharat, Austeralia aur New Zealand mein tehqeqaat shuru” (The Daily Express, 5th April, 2016: p 01).*

*“Panama Leaks ny Sharif khandaan ki sachae per mohar sabit kr di: Pervaiz Rasheed” (The Daily Express, 5th April, 2016: p 01).*

*“Offshore companian mehnat ki kamae han, corruption nahinki: Hussain Nawaz” (The Daily Express, 5th April, 2016: p 01).*

*“Nawaz Sharif ka Panama Leaks per adaalti commission bnanay ka elaan” (The Daily Express, 6th April, 2016: p 01).*

*“Panama Leaks mein aisa kuch nahin jiska notice lia jayee: Election Commission” (The Daily Express, 6th April, 2016: p 01).*

The first part of the first headline is without any verb and object but the agent (politician's secret asset) is there whereas the second part is without any agent. The process is investigation. In second headline the agent is “Panama Leaks” whereas the object is “Sharif khandaan ki sachae (Sharif family's innocence)”. The process is “mohar sabit kr di (confirmation)”. Here the editor appears to disseminate the impression that this scandal is not against the Sharif Family rather it is a proof of their innocence (a statement of one of aides of Nawaz Sharif). The third headline is similar to the headline of the ‘Daily Jang’ where the son of PM tries to justify the means of his assets. The fourth headline is also quite similar to its contemporary papers where the agent is “Nawaz Sharif” who is referred to positively whereas the object is “adaalti (judicial) commission”. The process of the headline is “elaan (announcement)”. In the last headline, the agent is “Panama Leaks”; the object is “aisa kuch nahin (nothing worthwhile)”; and the process is “action lia ja saky (to take action)”. The statement is issued by a neutral institution, Election Commission. The editor has played skillfully by referring a responsible institution of the state because without such reference it may openly expose the policy of the paper. Thus, the pro – government tilt of the paper is obvious.

After analyzing transitivity in headlines, we can observe that the selection of the agent, process and object of the headlines may carry the ideologies of the papers' (Carvehlo, 2008; & Islam et.al, 2015). The Dawn newspaper mostly appeared to be independent media whereas ‘Daily Times’ seemed to serve on government agenda (Islam et. al, 2015). Urdu newspapers made agent to the government representatives often in positive context but the opposition representatives negatively which reflect its pro-government policy over the issue. Thus, Ideologies are embedded in the text through the ‘selection and representation of actor, object, and theme in the text’ (Carvehlo, 2013; & Islam et.al, 2015).

### Word Choice

The mainstream English newspaper “The Dawn” has used the words like “reveal, exposed, and probe, etc.” All these terms indicate that something hidden has been disclosed which help to arise suspicion among its readers. The first two terms “reveal and exposed” are almost synonyms. It means to disclose something which was previously unknown or obscure whereas the term “probe” refers to find out something. Other terms are “bigwigs” and “Sharif Family”. The first term “bigwigs” is an umbrella term used with “exposed”. It refers to iconic personalities of the country who are exposed in the scandal. The term ‘Sharif Family’ is also an umbrella term which does not refer to any individual but the whole family which is stained with illegal possessions. The use of all these terms exhibits its fair reporting and neutral policy.

Another popular Pakistani English newspaper, “Daily Times”, has used the terms like “opens, Pandora's box, and probe” etc. The phrase Pandora's Box means a source of unseen trouble whereas the term ‘opens’ refers to publicize something. The editor has tried to give the prediction that Leak has opened a new plethora of troubles. The other term is ‘probe’ which has been used in similar connotation as in other English papers. Thus, instead of labeling it a blessing in disguise, the editor has labeled it a source of unseen trouble which shows its tilt towards the ruling family. Here, we can observe a deliberate attempt to conceal the facts from the general public through the clever use of the words.

Urdu newspaper ‘The Jang’ has used words or phrases “mehnat ki kamae (fruits of hard work)”, “tehqeqaat (investigation)”, “siasatdaan (politicians)”, tajir (traders)”, Sharif Khandaan (family)” etc. The first phrase is mentioned in the statement of PM's son with positive connotation whereas the word ‘tehqeqaat’ is used which is

less extreme as compared to probe. It has also tried to generalize by using umbrella terms rather than pointing out individuals. Thus, the use of “mehnat ki kamae” hints its pro government stance.

‘The Daily Express’ has used ‘khufia dollat (secret wealth)’ but this term is used with ‘siasatdaan’ which means that all politicians are guilty of holding secret wealth. It has not used this term categorically for Pakistani politicians especially for Prime Minister of Pakistan and his family in any of its headline. The other terms are “sachae (truthfulness)”, “mohar sabit kr di (confirmation stamp)”, “mehnat ki kamae”. All these positive terms are used for the government directly or indirectly which reflects pro-government policy of the paper.

Among English newspapers ‘The Dawn’ has generally used neutral and umbrella terms which show its neutral policy. On the other hand, Urdu newspapers have tried to use explanatory, less extreme and positive words with reference to the statements of the government representatives which exhibits their tilt towards government over the issue. It supports Lock’s (2004) argument that ‘people construct text to achieve a desired result with a particular audience’ (p.20).

### Referential Strategies

The use of the names of the political parties ‘PML-N, PTI’ and references of ‘opposition, critics’, ‘Sharif Family’, and ‘P.M’ show that the Dawn newspaper has not tried to over emphasize any political figure. It has not used full names of any figure but these terms are well known to the public. The other English newspaper ‘The Daily Times’ has used only two references ‘Nawaz’ and ‘rulers’ for ruling party while no reference is witnessed for opposition. The sole purpose behind this is to over emphasize Nawaz and to overshadow the importance of opposition leaders.

On the other hand, Urdu newspapers ‘The Jang’ and ‘The Express’ have used the umbrella terms like ‘taajir (trader), siastdaan (politicians), sanaatkaar (industrialists), Sharif khandaan (family)’ etc. to lessen the brunt of criticism over ruling family. It has used the reference of the premier leader of the ruling party ‘Nawaz Sharif’, to over emphasize his popularity whereas the leader of the opposition has not been mentioned even for a single time which seems to be a deliberate attempt to overshadow the popularity of opposition leaders.

The analysis of the referential strategies in the headlines shows that English newspaper, ‘The Dawn’, reports independently in publicizing the political figures. On the other hand, Urdu newspapers appear to over-emphasize the personalities of the ruling political party. Opposition leaders are over-shadowed. This analysis supports Islam et.al’s (2014) argument that ‘it seems to be a deliberate effort to save ruling party’s image and bring forward a goodwill for it in the public’(p.11). Our findings also prove Phelan’s (2009) and Coesemans’ (2012) argument that newspaper discourses may be angled to further the interests and image of the popular groups.

### Discursive Strategies

If we look at the Pakistani English newspapers’ headlines, the manipulation of the story will become clear. ‘The Daily Dawn’ deliberately backgrounds names of other politicians who hold offshore companies but it foregrounds Sharif Family just to defame them. The headline of 6th of April, 2016, is also framed in similar context where the editor has deliberately foregrounded PM’s sons. Here, its anti-government policy is obvious. The headline of “Daily Times” of 6th April, 2016, has foregrounded the Nawaz Sharif (the apex leader of the ruling party) to enhance his reputation. The important information has been backgrounded that his family and even he himself is facing the charge. Therefore, this paper showed its tilt towards the government.

On the other hand, ‘The Daily Jang’, has backgrounded the important information in its very first headline of 4th April, 2016, where it has generalized the scandal by using generic terms such as ‘siastdaan (politicians), tajir (trader), saanatkaar (industrialists)’, etc. It has not specified Sharif family or any other ruling political party’s representatives deliberately. It seems that it has been done to avoid the anti-government sentiments.

Other Urdu newspaper, ‘The Express’, has foregrounded the important information in the headline of 5th April, 2016, where politicians are inked generally. Here, the word ‘siasatdaan’ is foregrounded deliberately and the absence of the name of PM’s family is backgrounded deliberately to save its political image. Another headline, ‘panama leaks ny sharif khandaan ki sachae per mohar sabit kr di: Pervaiz Rasheed’, foregrounds the information that Sharif Family’s innocence has been proved. It has deliberately backgrounded the information that the innocence of the Sharif family is yet to be proven. The sole purpose behind framing this context is to disseminate the Sharif family’s good reputation which belongs to the ruling party. Another headline of 6th April, 2016, ‘Nawaz Sharif ka Panama Leaks per commission banaany ka elaan’, backgrounds the information that Nawaz Sharif himself is accused in this scandal along with his other family members. The sole purpose behind backgrounding this information is to secure the reputation of Sharif Family. So, its pro-government policy is obvious.

In short, discursive strategies show that Urdu newspapers appear to be pro-government whereas English newspaper, especially 'The Dawn', seems anti-government in their policy over this particular issue. Hence, framing is an effective strategy to disclose the secret policy of the newspaper (Carvehlo, 2008).

#### Ideological Standpoint

As we have already mentioned that ideologies are embedded in the discourse. There is no separate framework to grasp out the hidden ideologies. Other analytical tools help us to carve out ideologies of the papers. If we talk about page layout, transitivity, discursive strategies, word choice and referential strategies, which we have discussed earlier, we will come to know that apart from 'Daily Times' the other selected English Newspaper seems to be independent in its policies over the issue whereas the selected Urdu newspapers are pro-government in expressing their ideologies regarding the selected issue. Thus, we can argue that English and Urdu newspapers express different ideologies which show our actual media picture (Shoeb, 2008). It also supports Carvehlo's (2008) and Van Dijk's (1998,) arguments that 'semantic structures of discourse form the core content of the expression of ideological opinions.

#### Comparative-synchronic Analysis

The similar headlines regarding Panama Leaks scandal from different newspapers has been taken to conduct the comparative-synchronic analysis. Look at the first headlines over the issue from different English and Urdu newspapers;

*"Panama Papers reveal Sharif family's off shore holdings" (The Dawn, April 06, 2016: p.01).*

*"Panama Papers: leak opens Pandora's box in Pakistan". (Daily Times, April 05, 2016: p.01).*

*"Pakistan k kae siyasatdaan, tajir, sanatkaar berooney mulk companio k malik nikly". (The daily Jang, April 04, 2016: p.01).*

*"Pakistani siaastdaan peachy na rahy, berooney mulk karoron dollar dolaat chupae". (The Daily Express, April 05, 2016: p.01).*

These headlines are first treatment of the issue from the newspapers where every newspaper differs from the other. The Dawn newspaper has clearly mentioned the Sharif Family's name in its headline whereas 'Daily Times' has not specified any of government representatives. This shows that 'The Dawn' newspaper has adopted the direct approach whereas 'Daily Times' has adopted the diplomatic approach. 'Daily Times' has used the term 'Pandora's box' for this scandal which means a new unseen trouble. But realistically, it is not a Pandora's Box but a blessing in disguise which has unveiled the secret holdings of the corrupt members of the Pakistani society. It is a clear evidence of concealment of real motive of the scandal. The motive behind this concealment is to protect the Government representatives. So, its approach is pro-government in dealing the issue.

The treatment of 'The Jang' and 'The Daily Express' is very similar. Both have used umbrella terms like 'siasatdaan (politicians), tajir (traders), and sanatkaar (industrialists)' etc. These headlines have not mentioned any political figure which reflects their pro-government approach. Here are some more headlines from English and Urdu newspapers;

*"PM announces judicial probe to get sons cleared". (The Dawn, April 06, 2016: p.01).*

*"Nawaz orders probe into mega leaks" (Daily Times, April 06, 2016: p.01).*

*"Nawaz Sharif ka Panama Leaks per adaalti commission bnanay ka elaan" (The Daily Express, 6th April, 2016: p 01).*

'The Dawn' newspaper has elaborated the headline with phrase 'to get sons cleared' which shows the approach of the paper. It shows that PM's sons are named in the scandal for money laundering and holding offshore companies which will ultimately inflict damage to PM's repute. On the other hand, 'Daily Times' has composed the headline in such a way which will create the positive image of PM who is taking initiative to probe the scandal. It has included the term 'orders' for investigation into the mega leaks. It has backgrounded the information of Sharif Family's involvement. It shows that 'Daily Times' is functioning for the government agenda.

The headline of Urdu newspaper is also lacking in reference of PM's family members who are also facing charges. It is composed to create good image of the PM as an apex political leader of the government. It is an evidence of pro-government policy of the newspaper.

In short, comparative-synchronic analysis shows disparity between Urdu English Print Media in treatment of the issue. Urdu newspapers appear to tackle the news tactfully. It seems to develop a soft and positive image of the government. On the other hand, English newspaper 'The Dawn' has used direct approach and appears to report independently without the influence of the government. It seems neutral in its stance. But the stance of the 'Daily Times' newspaper seems pro-government. Both Urdu and English media houses have given the information accurately but still both were able to propagate their policy.

### CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In short, the textual and contextual analysis shows that how the media may manipulate the real event to express the hidden ideologies. It also highlights the control of the powerful segment of the society over the print media. Our analysis has revealed that there is a disparity between different newspapers in the presentation of a news event. It has reflected that discourse of English newspapers' headlines appears more rational and reasonable whereas the discourse of Urdu newspapers' headlines looks similar to an emotional script. English newspapers have selected direct, neutral and umbrella terms. It has employed discursive strategies to frame the context where negativity on the part of government has been exposed. 'The Dawn' newspaper has formulated the headlines to give, more or less, fair and unbiased information. Though, sometimes, its tilt is sensed against the government. Apparently, it becomes obvious that English paper 'The Dawn' is not controlled by the government as it works on neutral policy.

In contrast, Urdu newspapers, most of the time, exhibit pro government stance in dispensation of the information. They tried to portray government representatives in positive context to create their positive image while the members of opposition are mentioned as the agent of the negative context. They have used less extreme, more democratic and emotional terms for the government whereas the harsh and less democratic terms for the opposition. They have framed the context and used the references to eulogies the government actions and reaction over the issue. Comparative synchronic analysis helps to conclude that the Urdu print media is being controlled by the government. Urdu newspapers use this platform to manipulate the same event in their own favor to achieve their political objectives. Thus, reality is manipulated before it reaches to the audience. People are only exposed to the single side of the coin whereas other side is never shown to them deliberately.

Furthermore, this study suggests that linguists and social researchers need to pay their attention towards the manipulation of information which is tarnishing our social fabric. There is also a room to conduct discourse analysis of both the print media as well as the electronic media. This study can be applied in the language teaching classrooms at the higher level to teach the students that how they can expose the discourse manipulation of the print media which will be beneficial for them in the process of meaning making. This may also be helpful to investigate the discourse of various political groups to trace their hidden ideologies. In this regard, a special attention is needed in underdeveloped countries where media and political discourses are used to exploit less educated and gullible masses.

### REFERENCES

1. Bagnall, N. (1993). *Newspaper Language*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
2. Bell, A. (1991). *The language of news media*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
3. Betz, F. (2017). Model of the International Financial Grid and the Panama Papers. *Theoretical Economics Letters*, 7(04), 764.
4. Brisau, A. (1969). *Complex sentence structure in headlines*. *English Studies*, 50(1), 3 1-38.
5. Brown, Don P. and Simpson, D. (2002). "How to write good headlines". Retrieved July 2011 <<http://www.apwuioa.com>>.
6. Bukhari, S. (2015). *Comparative Study of Urdu and English Newspaper Headlines of Pakistan: Different Representation, Same News*. *International Journal of humanities and social sciences* vol. 05, no. 10.
7. Carvalho, A. (2008) *Media(ted) Discourse and Society*. *Journalism Studies*, 9:2, 161-177, DOI: 10.1080/14616700701848162
8. Chadwick, A. (2017). *The hybrid media system: Politics and power*. Oxford University Press.
9. Chang, T. K., & Lee, J. W. (1992). *Factors affecting gatekeepers' selection of foreign news: A national survey of newspaper editors*. *Journalism Quarterly*, 69(3), 554-561.

10. Coesemans, R. (2012). Contrastive news discourse analysis from a pragmatic perspective. *Contrastive Media Analysis: Approaches to Linguistic and Cultural Aspects of Mass Media Communication*, 226.
11. Crystal, D. & Davy, D. (1969). *Investigating English Style*. London: Longman.
12. Crystal, D. (1992). *An encyclopedic dictionary of language and languages*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
13. Dor, D. (2003). *On newspaper headlines as relevance optimizers*. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 35, 695—721.
14. Fairclough, N. (2001). *Language and power* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Longman.
15. Fairclough, N. (2003). *Analyzing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research* London: Routledge.
16. Fairclough, N. (2005). *Discourse analysis in organization studies: The case for critical realism*. *Organization Studies*, 26 (6): 915-939.
17. Farooq, A., Shahbaz, M., Arouri, M., & Teulon, F. (2013). *Does corruption impede economic growth in Pakistan?* *Economic Modelling*, 35, 622-633.
18. Fowler, R. (1991). *Language in the News: Discourse and Ideology in the Press*. London: Routledge
19. Gee, J. P. (2010). *How to do Discourse Analysis: A Toolkit*. Abingdon K: Routledge.
20. Ipoová, A. (2011) *Headlines and Sub-headlines: Tenses, Modality and Register: Based on Discourse Analysis of the British Thblod; The Sun*.
21. Johnstone, B. (2018). *Discourse analysis*. John Wiley & Sons.
22. Kheeshadeh, M. (2012). *Effects of globalization on tv and print media in pakistan*. *International Journal of Asian Social Science*, 2(9), 1441-1456.
23. Khodabandeh, F. (2007). *A Contrastive Analysis of English and Persian Newspaper Headlines*. *Linguistics Journal* 2 (1).
24. Mårdh, I. (1980). *Headlines: On the grammar of English front page headlines*. Lund: Gleerup
25. Islam, M, Kamal, M. K, & Rashid, R. (2015). *Power and Media: A Critical Discours Analysis of Pro-government and Independent Press in Pakistan*. *Kashmir Journal of Language Research*, Vol. 18 No.2.
26. Nani I. Tiono (2003) *An Analysis of Semantic and Syntactic Factors Found in Newspapers headlines*. *Jurusan Sastra Inggris, Fakultas Sastra, Universitas Kristen Petra* <http://puslit.petra.ac.id/journals/letters!> Volume05. Number 02: 49-6 1.
27. Nir, R. A. (1993). *Discourse analysis of news headlines*, *Hebrew Linguistics*, 37, 23-31.
28. Malik, R. (2016). "Panamanian" Epidemic. *Defence Journal*, 19(10), 85.
29. Mallette, M. F. (1990). *Handbook for Journalists of Central and Eastern Europe*. Washington: World Press Freedom Committee.
30. Olowe J. (1993) *Language and Ideology in Nigerian Newspapers in the English Medium*. An Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, Obafemi Awolowo University Ile-Ife.
31. Phelan, S. (2009). The newspaper as political antagonist: Editorial discourse and the othering of Maori perspectives on the foreshore and seabed conflict. *Journalism*, 10(2), 217-237.
32. PHILO & GREG (2007) "Can Discourse Analysis Successfully Explain the Content of Media and Journalistic Practice?", *Journalism Studies* 8(2), pp. 17596.
33. Práková, E. (2009). *Grammar in newspaper headlines*. Retrieved November 19, 2010, from <http://dspace.upce.cz/bitstream110195/34683/1/PraskovaEGrammarInPH2009.pdf>

34. Reah, D. (1998). *The Language of Newspapers*. London: Routledge.
35. Reah, D. (2002). *The language of newspapers*. London: Routledge.
36. Richardson, E. (2007). She was workin like foreal': critical literacy and discourse practices of African American females in the age of hip hop. *Discourse & Society*, 18(6), 789-809.
37. Shoeb, N. F. (2008). *An analysis of Urdu and English editorial coverage of the 2007 emergency from Pakistani newspapers*. ProQuest
38. Simpson, P. (1993). *Language, Ideology and Point of View*. London: Routledge. Fairciough, Norman. Media Discourse. London: Edward Arnold, 1995.
39. Taiwo, R. (2007). *Language, ideology and power relations in Nigerian newspaper headlines*. Nebula 4(1), 218-245.
40. Timuçin, M. (2010). *Different language styles in newspapers: An investigative framework*. Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies, 6(2), 104-126.
41. Thomas, L. & Wareing, S. (1999). *Language, society and power*. London: Routledge.
42. Turner, G.W. (1972). *The grammar of newspaper headlines containing the preposition on in the sense 'about'*. Linguistics, 87, 71-86.
43. Ungerer, F. (2000). *English media texts past and present language and textual structure*. Philadelphia, PA: John Benjamins.
44. Van Dijk T. (1997). *What is political discourse analysis?* See Blommaert & Bulcaen 1997, pp. 11—52.
45. Van Dijk, T. A. (1988). *News as discourse*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum.
46. Van Dijk, T.A. (1999) 'Context Models in Discourse Processing', in H. van Oostendorp and SR. Goldman (eds) *The Construction of Mental Representations during Reading*, pp. 123—48. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.
47. Wodak, R. (2001). *The discourse-historical approach*. In Wodak, R. and Meyer, M. (Eds), *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. London: Sage, 63—95.
48. Yadegarfar, M. (2014). *A Contrastive Analysis of Headlines in Native & Nonnative English Newspapers*.
49. Zaheer, L. (2015). *Tharparker Famine 2014: Comparative analysis of Pakistan's English and Urdu media coverage*. *Pakistan Vision*, 16(2), 55-86.

## APPENDIXES A

### Newspaper & Websites

- Daily Times (April 04, 2016). Retrieved April 04, 2016 from <https://dailytimes.com.pk>
- Daily Times (April 05, 2016). Retrieved April 05, 2016 from <https://dailytimes.com.pk>
- Daily Times (April 06, 2016). Retrieved April 06, 2016 from <https://dailytimes.com.pk>
- The Express (April 04, 2016). Retrieved April 04, 2016 from <https://www.express.com.pk!paper/index.aspx?issue=NPLHE>
- The Express (April 05, 2016). Retrieved April 05, 2016 from <https://www.express.com.pk!paper/index.aspx?issue=NPLHE>
- The Express (April 06, 2016). Retrieved April 06, 2016 from <https://www.express.com.pk!paper/index.aspx?issue=NPLHE>
- Some data has been received personally from the hard copy of the old newspapers 'first page from a famous public institution, Punjab Public Library, Mall Road, Lahore.

APPENDIXES B

THE DAWN

FOUNDED BY QUAID-I-AZAM MOHAMMAD ALI JINNAH

### 'Panama Papers' reveal Sharif family's 'offshore holdings'

Investigative Journalism — one of around 100 news organisations and 300 journalists that worked on mining the data simultaneously — also reveals the offshore holdings of members of Prime Minister Sharif's family.

According to documents available on the ICIJ website, the PM's children, Mariam, Hasan and Hassan, "were owners or had the right to authorize transactions for several companies".

Mariam is described as "the owner of British Virgin Islands Limited and Novoco Limited, incorporated in 1994 and 1997".

On one of the documents released by ICIJ, the address listed for Novoco Enterprises is Seven Palace in Jeddah, Saudi Arabia. This document, dated June 2012, identifies Mariam Saeed as the "beneficial owner".

According to ICIJ, "Hasan and Mariam signed a document dated June 2007 that was part of a series of transactions in which Novoco Bank Limited, owned by Novoco and another company, sold their London properties for \$11.2 million to Novoco, Ltd".

In July 2004, the two companies were transferred to another name.

described as "the sole director of Hampton Property Holdings Limited incorporated in the British Virgin Islands in February 2005, which acquired Liberian-based First Coast Holdings Entertainment Limited for about \$1.2 million in August 2007".

The papers are the most nearly exhaustive of wrongdoing

04-04-2016

www.dailytimes.com.pk

# Daily Times

## Panama Papers: leak opens Pandora's Box in Pakistan

Amid calls for NAB to launch probe, Sharifs deny they have done anything wrong

By Farooq Awan

ISLAMABAD: The Panama leaks have whipped a storm of controversy over off-shore wealth of the political elite of Pakistan, especially the ruling Sharif family.

of Masood Textiles, Zulfqar Ali Lakhani of Lakson Group and Zulfikar Paracha of Universal Corporation (Pvt) Ltd, among several others.

Though Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif himself does not own any company, three of his children — Maryam

apartments are ours and those offshore companies are also ours," he said, as he fully owned the revelations made in the leaks. He was held enough to declare that the British

05-04-2016

### Offshore Holdings of Sharifs Exposed

ICIJ documents that the Sharif family have owned or controlled several offshore companies, including Novoco Enterprises, which is based in London. The documents also reveal that the Sharif family has owned or controlled several other companies, including Hampton Property Holdings, which is based in the British Virgin Islands.

06-04-2016

### An Eyewash?

Sharif's denial that he owned any offshore companies is seen as an attempt to deflect attention from the fact that his family has a significant stake in several of the companies mentioned in the leaks.

06-04-2016

www.jang.com.pk

پاکستان کے روزنامہ جہانگیر

ABC CERTIFIED

# جنگ لاہور

05-04-2016

### PM announces judicial probe to get sons cleared

Recalls hardships at the hands of successive PPP govts, opponents not impressed by speech

By Hameed Ghannaman

ISLAMABAD: In an effort to ease the minds of voters, the PM announced a judicial probe to get his sons cleared of any wrongdoing.

06-04-2016

### Oppositioners reignite row between PTI, PML-N

Based on the latest reports, the PTI and PML-N have reignited their row over the alleged involvement of the PTI in the 2008 election. The PTI has accused the PML-N of rigging the election, while the PML-N has accused the PTI of rigging the election.

05-04-2016

پیسے کاروبار کیلئے نہیں جلا وطنی کے دوران رہن سہن کیلئے لیکر گئے، حسین نواز  
 اتفاق کرپ بڑا کاروباری ادارہ تھا، اس نے کہاں گئے یہ انتقام کا نشانہ بن گیا وہاں سے پچھلیس  
 مرحلہ فرسٹی ہیں پر اپنی کا کا کو نہیں لے سکتیں۔ آج شاہزیب خانزادہ کیساتھ میں گفتگو  
 کر رہی (ٹی وی رپورٹ) بیج کے پروگرام آج صاحبزادے سمن نواز نے گفتگو کرتے ہوئے کہا ہے کہ  
 شاہزیب خانزادہ کے ساتھ میں وزیراعظم کے  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 18

آئی سی آئی سے نئے شریف جھلی پر  
 کسی غلط کام کا الزام نہیں لگا یا، ترجمان  
 کراچی (ٹی وی رپورٹ) شریف جھلی کے ترجمان  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 19

پاناما پیپرز کے باعث پاکستان کی  
 سیاست میں نئی محاذ آرائی شروع  
 اسلام آباد (عالمی وقت) پاناما پیپرز نے پاکستان کی  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 20

پاکستان کے کئی سیاستدان، تاجر، صنعتکار، بیرون ملک کمپنیوں کے مالک نکلے  
 شہزادہ مریم، حسین، حسن نواز، جاوید ایثار، رحمان ملک، چوہدری اور سیف اللہ برادران بھی شامل  
 آئس لینڈ، برطانیہ سمیت غیر ملکی سربراہان، شہنشاہ، ماجا بھوشور، یہ خاندان اور جنگی جن بھی کمپنیوں کے مالک  
 وزیراعظم نواز شریف اور شہباز شریف کی براہ راست ملکیت میں کوئی تبدیلی نہیں  
 دنیا میں دولت پیسے کے قانونی طریقے ہی ہیں اور ہمارے یہی نہیں کہ یہ سب کام غیر قانونی ہے آئی سی آئی ہے  
 اسلام آباد (مر جیس) خفہ دستاویزات کا ترجمان جلی کمپنیوں میں لوٹ پاکستان سمیت دنیا کے متعدد  
 کرنے والی غیر  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 15

04-04-2016

پاناما لیکس کے افشاں ثابت، بیج کا آف شور کمپنیوں کے مالکان کیخلاف کارروائی پر نواز  
 حاضر رہیں جج ہارک فراد کاروباری شخصیات اور سیاستدانوں کے نام شامل، جرنیل کا نام نہیں سے  
 اسلام آباد (انصار جماعتی) قومی احتساب بیورو کارروائی کے آغاز کیلئے پاناما لیکس میں کیے گئے  
 (بیج) آف شور کمپنیوں کے مالکان کیخلاف ٹکنڈ  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 21

پاناما پیپرز کے افشاں نے نئی بحث چھیڑ دی  
 اسلام آباد (رپورٹ) بیج کے نام شامل، پاناما پیپرز کے  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 22

بیرون ملک بیرونی کوئی کمپنی یا جائیداد نہیں ضرورت  
 دا زمر بطور رجسٹرڈ ہے، آج سے کرکھارہ

پاناما لیکس فہرست میں  
 500 بھارتی شامل ہیں  
 لاہور (سار شاہ) بھارت کے معروف اخبار انڈین  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 28

کمیشن شریف خاندان سمیت 250 پاکستانیوں کی تحقیقات کریگا  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 29

06-04-2016

EXPRESS PAKISTAN PAVILION 11-13 APRIL 2016  
 پاناما لیکس کے افشاں نے نئی بحث چھیڑ دی  
 اسلام آباد (رپورٹ) بیج کے نام شامل، پاناما پیپرز کے  
 ستمبر 11 جی نمبر 22

بیرون ملک بیرونی کوئی کمپنی یا جائیداد نہیں ضرورت  
 دا زمر بطور رجسٹرڈ ہے، آج سے کرکھارہ

DAILY EXPRESS  
 روزنامہ اکیس برس  
 05-04-2016