# PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt / Egyptology

# CURRENT PATH TO COMMUNITY BASED SUSTAINABLE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT OF KHANH HOA PROVINCE IN VIETNAM

Pham Bich Ngoc<sup>1</sup>, Nguyen Hoang Tien<sup>2</sup>, Tran Thi Thuy Trang<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Vietnam Institute of Economics, Vietnam

<sup>2</sup>Saigon International University, Vietnam

<sup>3</sup>Van Lang University, Vietnam

Corresponding Author: Email: 3trang. tranthi@vlu.edu.vn

Pham Bich Ngoc, Nguyen Hoang Tien, Tran Thi Thuy Trang. Current Path to Community Based Sustainable Tourism Development of Khanh Hoa Province in Vietnam -- Palarch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology 18(9), 508-525. ISSN 1567-214x

Keywords: Khanh Hoa Tourism, Sustainable Development, Foreign Tourists, Domestic Tourists.

# **ABSTRACT:**

The article analyzes the current situation of Khanh Hoa province (Vietnam) tourism in terms of sustainable development in the period 2010-2019. This is the result of the research project "Model of sustainable tourism development with community participation in Khanh Hoa province" from September 2019 to November 2020 by Pham Bich Ngoc. The study used PESTEL method and surveyed tourists to Khanh Hoa province with 726 samples. The research results show that Khanh Hoa province tourism develops very quickly but is not really sustainable. There are still many problems that need to be adjusted, especially when it is strongly affected by the external environment. Besides, the article also gives some policy implications to help Khanh Hoa province develop sustainable tourism in the future.

#### INTRODUCTION

Tourism is one of the fastest growing industries in the world and is an important source of income for many countries and localities (Butler, 1991; Anh & Tien, 2019). Tourism offers many jobs for local residents. The 12th Congress of the Communist Party of Vietnam also affirmed that tourism is a key economic sector that needs to focus on national development and localities on the basis of promoting its strengths (Tourism Law, 2005; VNAT, 2015). Sustainable tourism - that is, to not only meet the demands of economic growth, but also to ensure cultural, social, security and environmental goals - is becoming increasingly popular as a mainstream economic and business activity in the

future (Anh et al, 2021; Butler, 1991; Dung et al, 2019a; Gabriel et al, 2017; Harris et al, 2002; Muller, 1994; Tien et al, 2020; Tien, 2018; Viet et al, 2020; Vinh et al, 2019a; UNEP, 2005; Villanueva-Avaro et al, 2017). As a central province with a lot of tourism potentials, Khanh Hoa has made great efforts over the years to develop tourism, attracting a large number of domestic and foreign tourists (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020; KHDST, 2020).

However, in theory, sustainable tourism development in Khanh Hoa province has also been emphasized in the undertakings and policies of the province, but in research projects as well as in practice of state management, the criteria for assessment and monitoring of sustainability have not been specified and applied regularly (Thuy & Ngoc, 2014; Thuy & Nga, 2013). In practical terms, there have been many policies to promote the development of the tourism industry towards rapid and sustainable growth (Tuu & Cam, 2012). However, the planning and state management of local tourism sector still has certain limitations. The benefits and community participation in sustainable tourism development have not been given due attention. There is still conflicts between exhausted exploitation of natural and cultural resources for short-term interests of tourism companies and long-term conservation and development for the national interests; between the interests of tourism companies and the interests of local people (Goeldner, 2000; Zainal et al, 2012). That requires in-depth research and appropriate policy formulation, especially in the context of increasingly strong globalization and economic integration. Therefore, the study conducted analysis and assessment of the current status of the development of the Khanh Hoa province tourism industry in the period 2010-2018 in terms of sustainable development to find out the weaknesses that need to be overcome, thereby giving suggestions policies to help Khanh Hoa province develop tourism in a sustainable way in the coming time.

# LITERATURE AND RESEARCH OVERVIEW

The United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO, 2015) introduced the concept of sustainable tourism in 2005 as: "Sustainable tourism includes all types of tourism, including including large-scale and small tourism types. The principle of sustainability in tourism is to address the economic and sociocultural and environmental aspects of tourism development, and a balance between these three factors should be established in order to ensure long-term sustainability goals"

UNESCO (2014) defines: "Sustainable tourism is a tourism that respects both local people, tourists, cultural heritage and the environment. It seeks to provide people with an enjoyable vacation but at the same time benefits the people of the host country". The United Nations Environment Program (UNEP, 2004) indicates three basic goals for Tourism development to ensure sustainability:

- Economic sustainability: sustainable development of tourism activities, creating significant jobs and revenues, positively contributing to the economic growth of society, bringing benefits to the community, especially especially the local people.
- Socio-cultural sustainability: exploiting the tangible and intangible cultural values to meet tourism needs, but not only not to damage and degrade them, but

also preserve and develop right direction; meeting the needs of improving the material, cultural and spiritual life of local people; do not create inequalities within communities.

- Sustainability of resources and the environment: is the use of resources that do not exceed their resilience, so as to meet current development needs but do not impair future renewable capacity to to meet the needs of generations to come.

However, the concept of "sustainability" is often abused in many contexts, leading to the fact that the authenticity of this concept is not intact and not fully understood. Therefore, another concept, "responsible tourism" is now increasingly used to attach responsibility for specific behaviors of stakeholders in the tourism chain, helping to define responsible tourism clearer to the activities of tourism industry in general (Sunlu, 2003; Muller, 1994; Tien, 2015).

The European Alliance for Responsible Tourism and Hospitality (EARTH) introduces the concept of responsible tourism as follows: "Responsible tourism adheres to the principles of socio-economic equity and full respect for the environment and cultural values, recognizing the central role of indigenous communities and the rights of communities. in developing responsible and sustainable tourism (Reisinger & Turner, 2003; Ritchie & Brent, 1978). Responsible tourism is the driving force to foster a positive interaction between the tourism industry, local communities and tourists" (McKercher, 1993; Goosling, 2002; Goosling & Peeters, 2015).

In essence, responsible tourism still aims to ensure the sustainability of environmental, cultural, social, and economic factors. However, responsibility is more specifically tied to (Tien, 2015; Diedrich & Aswani, 2016):

- Environment: minimizing negative impacts of tourism on the environment;
- Social: indigenous communities play a central role in tourism development in their area through democracy of participation and the decision-making process for sustainable tourism development;
- Culture: respecting indigenous culture through the incorporation of cultural values into tourism development, concentrating and forming a sense of culture, traditions, lifestyles, cuisine, and handicraft industries. geography;
- Economic: creating fair economic benefits for local communities.

There are also a number of other concepts such as ecotourism, geotourism, or volunteer tourism (voluntourism) that are also forms of sustainable tourism. While ecotourism emphasizes conservation and respect for the integrity of ecosystems, geotourism is more about building a visitor's perception of arriving at a pristine place (Barkauskasa et al, 2015; Duc et al, 2019; Tien, 2017c; Anh & Tien, 2019; Lucchetti & Arcese, 2014). Voluntary tourism is a form in which tourists both experience tourism and voluntarily contribute to the development of the local community where they come from (Thang, 2009; Meimand et al, 2013).

For the studies on sustainable tourism development in Khanh Hoa province, Van and Trai (2015) showed that Khanh Hoa province has many unique tourist

destinations for attracting domestic and international tourists, bringing significant income to the provincial economy. However, Khanh Hoa province's tourism is also facing a number of difficulties and challenges such as limited planning, inadequate investment, and unprofessional tourism promotion activities (Thai et al, 2019 & 2019a). Vy (2016) also emphasized that Khanh Hoa province needs to strengthen propaganda, tourism promotion, diversification, professionalization and quality improvement. quantity of tourism products, increase resources for tourism development in the process of international economic integration.

The article analyzes the current situation of Khanh Hoa province tourism development in the 2010-2018 period under the perspective of sustainable development, based on the following methods:

- PESTEL method (Politics; Economic; Social; Technology; Environment; Legal). This method assesses the current situation of Khanh Hoa province tourism development in the period 2010-2018 on all four angles of sustainable development: Economy; Social; Environment; Legal (issues of national defense and security).
- Method of surveying tourists: The study was built according to the 2018 survey on tourists coming from 6 countries to Khanh Hoa province with 726 samples. The number of samples is classified according to quotas, ensuring the following characteristics: gender, age, and occupation.

The article collects data from official sources in Vietnam such as the General Statistics Office, Khanh Hoa Department of Tourism and specialized reports and published studies such as scientific reports, books, monographs, scientific magazines, articles to collect information about the directions strategies and policies for sustainable tourism development in Vietnam, the good and bad aspects in tourism development in the past time, from which some policy suggestions are made to develop Khanh Hoa province tourism in a sustainable direction.

# Current State of Khanh Hoa Tourism Development In 2010-2019

One thing can be affirmed, since Vietnam joined the WTO, especially in the period 2010-2019, is that the number of tourists, especially the international tourists, to Khanh Hoa province has increased significantly every year. In 2019, the total number of tourists to Khanh Hoa province stood at 7 million arrivals, an increase of 3.8 times per year. There were 3.56 million international tourists to Khanh Hoa province, an increase of 9.25 times in 2010, accounting for 51% of the number of tourists coming to Khanh Hoa province and 20% of the total number of international tourists of the whole country. The total number of tourists arrived to Khanh Hoa province from 2010 to the end of 2019 reached over 40.17 million, of which over 13.44 million were international. The annual growth rate of the number of tourists to Khanh Hoa province reached 16.17%, especially in 2013, the total number of tourists staying in Khanh Hoa province increased 29.42% over the same period, the highest increase in 2010-2019 (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020; KHDST, 2020; NTOTD, 2020). This is a very good thing for the Khanh Hoa province tourism industry. This can be confirmed,

that tourism has been and will bring Khanh Hoa province a greater opportunity in the process of transforming tourism industry into a key economic sector of the province.

#### **Domestic Tourist Market:**

The number of domestic tourists coming to Khanh Hoa province always keeps a steady positive growth rate (the average from 2010 to 2019 is 10.44% per year) and accounts for a significant part of the total number of coming tourists (60-70%). Especially in 2013, the growth rate was up to 28.29%, in particular, the number of visitors from the Ho Chi Minh City (50.5%); from other provinces in the Southeast of Vietnam (9.0%); the Mekong delta (5.5%); Central Highlands, Hanoi and Hai Phong (27, 8%), other Northern provinces (12.5%) (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020). The main purpose of domestic tourists is still sightseeing; resort; life experience; conferences; visiting relatives and friends; exploring investment opportunities in combination with tourism; medical treatment and honeymoon.

#### International Tourist Market:

The number of international tourists coming to Khanh Hoa province in the period 2010-2019 has increased dramatically (an average increase of 28.95% per year from 2010-2019), especially in 2017, this figure was 68.91%. In 2019, for the first time, the international tourist market surpasses the domestic tourist market (KHDST, 2020; NTOTD, 2020).

In 2010-2018, 10 main international tourism markets of Khanh Hoa province were China, Russia, Korea, Australia, US, UK, France, Germany, Japan and Canada. Especially in 2016 - 2019, the top 3 tourist markets in Khanh Hoa province were China, Russia and South Korea (KHDST, 2020; NTOTD, 2020). In 2018 and 2019, China and Russia alone accounted for over 83% of the total number of international tourists to Khanh Hoa province (KHDST, 2020; NTOTD, 2020). This shows that the number of international tourists to Khanh Hoa province is dependent on a number of major markets, which has many potential risks affecting the sustainability of the Khanh Hoaprovince tourism market.

In addition, the rapid development of Chinese tourism market and the Russian tourism market has led to a decline in some key tourism markets of Khanh Hoa province, particularly in the period 2014 - 2016, the number of tourists from France market down 30.19%, followed by the Korean market down 30.12%, the German market down 29.48%, the Australian market down 23.87%, the UK market down 23.12%, the US market decreased by 16.93% and the Canadian market decreased by 15.65%. In 2017- 2018 the number of visitors from Western Europe and North America dropped sharply by 20-30% (KHDST, 2020; NTOTD, 2020). This key market segment had a significant impact on the business performance of Khanh Hoa province tourism and also poses a problem on the growth quality from a market perspective.

With the advantage of island tourism, along with supportive policies for tourism as well as tourism brand development in Khanh Hoa province, the total number of coming tourists by ship in 2010-2018 reached 545 thousand arrivals, with a total of 406 trips, the average annual growth of this period reached 21.3%. In 2019, there is a slight downward trend (Dung et al, 2019; Kotler & Keller, 2006; KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020).

# SUSTAINABILITY OF KHANH HOA TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN 2010-2019

The article assesses the current status of Khanh Hoa province tourism development in the 2010-2019 in terms of sustainable development based on PESTEL method/model (Politics; Economy; Social; Technology; Environment; Legal).

#### **Politic**

The Khanh Hoa province (the South East Central coastal province in vietnam) in particular and Vietnam in general has a relatively stable geopolitical position. As a sea endowed by nature plus a relatively stable legal system, the legal framework expands and adjusts to the actual situation of the Khanh Hoa province tourism industry and in accordance with the direction of the Politburo. According to Resolution No. 08-NQ / TW dated January 16, 2017 of the XII Politburo on developing tourism to become a key national economic sector; Khanh Hoa Provincial Party Committee launched Action Plan No. 14-CTr / TU dated 24/7/2017 on the implementation of Resolution No. 08-NQ / TW dated January 16, 2017 of the Politburo and Decision No. 480 / QD-UBND dated February 9, 2018 on the issuance of the Plan for the implementation of Action Program No. 14-CTr / TU dated 24/7/2017 of Khanh Hoa Provincial Party Committee. These are important bases and premises for the development of Khanh Hoa province's tourism in the coming time with the following specific contents: Raising awareness of society on tourism development, perfecting the tourism development strategy; Building mechanisms and policies to promote tourism development and tourism human resources development; Improving the capacity of state tourism management, cooperation in tourism development.

Decision No. 1685 / QD-TTg dated December 5, 2018 of the Prime Minister approving the project "Restructuring the tourism industry to meet the requirements of development into a key economic sector" is with determination to redirect growth according to the model of in-depth growth, expand opportunities for development and cooperation in Khanh Hoa province's tourism industry. Khanh Hoa province has increasingly attracted tourists from all over the world. This is also the inheritance continuing to implement the Prime Minister's Decision No. 251/2006 / QD-TTg dated October 31, 2006 approving the master plan on socio-economic development of Khanh Hoa province to 2020 and Resolution No. 01/2007 / NQ-HDND dated 02/02/2007 of the People's Council on the approval of the master plan for Khanh Hoa province's tourism development up to 2010 and with orientation to 2020.

In addition to the construction of short and long-term tourism development strategies, the recent Law on Tourism has created a clear and open legal corridor

to improve the efficiency of state tourism management as well as to create favorable conditions and environments for tourism companies to operate.

It can be said that this is the consistency in awareness, in vision and in the strategy from central to local to make Khanh Hoa province a destination of the XXI century while expanding responsibility for local governments, especially Khanh Hoa Department of Tourism. By step by step consolidating the reestablishment of Khanh Hoa Department of Tourism, mechanisms and policies for tourism development are increasingly completed, creating favorable conditions for the tourism activities in Khanh Hoa province in order to becomes a tourism development center of the South Central Coast region and the whole Vietnam.

#### **Economics**

Undeniably, along with ceaseless development of the world, people's lives are constantly improving. With preference for geographic location and the consistency in vision and strategy, investments in tourism are increased in Khanh Hoa province as it achieves best advantages of the times. This has helped the total income from tourism in Khanh Hoa province constantly increase, helping its economy increase dramatically. Total tourism income of Khanh Hoa province in 2019 is 1.18 billion USD, 10 times higher than in 2010 (0.14 billion USD) and accounts for 52.19% of GRDP. Average growth of total income from tourism from 2010 to 2019 reached 27.47% (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020).

This is because Khanh Hoa province has built up a diversified and rich tourism products system, especially focusing on sea-island products with increasingly high quality. However, with its geographical location as a long coastline, Khanh Hoa province has not yet effectively exploited tourism products based on mountain activities with values of ecological landscape and indigenous culture. However, it is easy to see that among the number of international tourists to Khanh Hoa province, the number of Chinese tourists accounts for a very large part and is increasing. This leads to an imbalance in the local structure of international tourists. If in 2013, the number of Chinese tourists to Khanh Hoa province only accounted for 3.92% of local international tourists, 1.46% of Chinese tourists to Vietnam and 0.37% of international tourists. By 2019, these figures were 70% (18 times as much as in 2013), 41.38% (28 times as much as in 2013) and 13.33% (36 times as much as in 2013) (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020).

The increase in the number of Chinese tourists will help Khanh Hoa province to boost the tourism revenue. If in 2013, the ratio of revenue from tourism by GRDP is 16.49%, in 2019, this figure is 52.19% (KHPCMP, 2020; KHDST, 2020). But if we are too dependent on income from China, there may be times when China cuts off the source of tourists to Vietnam (for subjective or objective reasons), the whole economy of Khanh Hoa will become unsustainable.

Regarding tourist spending in Khanh Hoa province, it is said that the average daily spending of Chinese tourists in Vietnam is relatively small. According to

the report of Khanh Hoa Department of Tourism in 2018, the average spending per day per Chinese tourist in Khanh Hoa province was 112.31 USD. Although it is higher than the average daily spending of Chinese tourists in Vietnam (96 USD), it is still relatively low compared to tourists from Japan, Western Europe, America and South Korea. In particular, the spending rate of Chinese tourists per day is only equal to one-quarter of that of Korean visitors in Vietnam. According to the analysis above, Chinese and Russian visitors account for over 83% of international visitors to Khanh Hoa province, but in fact, the income from tourists in these two markets is still relatively modest (KHPCMP, 2020; KHDST, 2020).

First, this happened due to the influence of a series of Chinese 0 USD tours to Vietnam. In essence, cheap tour is a form of price competition according to the market mechanism. Low-cost basic tours include minimum service at the destination (Beerli & Martin, 2004; Davidoff, 1994; Kozak & Rimmington, 2000). However, tourists are encouraged to use many other services such as shopping, sightseeing, fun, entertainment, dining (Tuan et al, 2019). These short-term basic tours often cut the program or force guests to enter surrounding shopping venues with high-priced goods. In a nutshell, 0 USD tours lead to tax losses and strongly affect destinations' image in general and Khanh Hoa province in particular.

Second, if calculated by trip, Chinese tourists spend on average about 557 USD per trip in Vietnam (about 30% of the average spending of Chinese people traveling abroad - 1,850 USD per trip). Of the USD 557 per trip, 19.4% was spent on accommodation, 19.22% was spent on goods and souvenirs. Vietnam has not yet exploited tourists from China's top major cities such as Shanghai, Beijing, Guangzhou and Shenzhen. Chinese tourists come to Vietnam mainly from the outskirts cities such as Chongqing, Hefei, and Kunming. This is the alarming bell and not advisable for Vietnam, if still focusing on exploiting and depending one single market segment. Especially when the number of Chinese people traveling to Vietnam accounts for only 0.35% of Chinese people traveling abroad. Only 0.35% of those Chinese tourists made the Vietnamese economy heavily affected in the context of COVID-19 pandemic (KHPCMP, 2020; KHDST, 2020). This is also important reason the Khanh Hoa province tourism industry is developed but not yet sustainable.

# Society

The tourism development of Khanh Hoa province has also increased the quality of social life of indigenous people. The face of Khanh Hoa province has changed markedly after 10 years of tourism development. First, due to the improved system of accommodation and facilities, the number of tourists coming to Khanh Hoa province has increased rapidly, leading to constantly upgrade and newly built system of restaurants and hotels to serve the needs of tourists. By the end of 2018, the whole Khanh Hoa province had 750 accommodation establishments with 39,400 rooms, in which the number of 3-5 star rooms accounts for nearly 50%. Overall, the number of these properties has met the needs of guests, even during the high season. Hotel occupancy in recent years has been relatively high and stable (more than 60%). In general, the number of

accommodations that have not yet been rated is increasing. In 2019, the total number of establishments that have not yet ranked is 925 with 28,189 rooms, of which there are 124 large-scale with 15,843 rooms, reaching the rate of 31.95%. Why is that? A prominent issue now is the increasing appearance of tourist apartments. But the management of a tourist apartment as a type of accommodation is still inadequate, affecting the general efficiency of tourism business. The tourist apartments are to be managed in accordance with the Tourism Law. But currently, 70% of projects operate with unclear uses: apartments for living, apartments for rent, and apartment owners organize their own accommodation services (KHPCMP, 2020; KHDST, 2020). Starting in 2015, the new Tourism Law has defined what is it while there are many projects with tourist apartments in Nha Trang that have been granted investment certificates before 2015 (Tourist Law, 2015).

Second, when the tourism industry develops, service and facilities systems for tourism in Khanh Hoa province are also developing constantly. According to statistics, by the end of 2019, Khanh Hoa province has 138 travel service business establishments, of which 20 domestic enterprises, 118 international enterprises (94 enterprises, 22 branches, 02 representative offices). The system of restaurants, culinary spots in addition to hotels, resorts in Khanh Hoa province currently has more than 150 establishments to meet the diverse needs of tourists. Transporting passengers at destinations is an indispensable service in tourism development activities (Davidoff, 1994; Pearce, 1997; Petrovic et al, 2017). Until 2018 in Khanh Hoa province, the transport capacity basically meets the needs of transporting passengers and visiting tourists (by boat, taxi, car and bus) with more than 316 fixed vehicle routes; 1,286 passenger transport business vehicles and contracts; 24 car transit; 14 taxi transport units with 1,250 vehicles and 100 pilot vehicles; 960 inland waterway vessels of all kinds (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020). Although the transport capacity to serve the needs of traveling and sightseeing in Khanh Hoa province is quite good, however, transportation of tourists by public and fixed transport according to the inner city routes with key tourist areas in the vicinity, especially Doc Let and beyond, Dam Mon as well as with Cam Ranh, has not been clearly formed. This is one of the limitations affecting Khanh Hoa province's tourism development in the future as a modern and friendly tourist destination. Third, the issue of labor force in the tourism industry in Khanh Hoa province.

# Lack Of Quantity.

The number of employees in tourism industry of Khanh Hoa province is constantly increasing year by year. According to statistics, the number of direct employees in 2010 is 12,421 people (lower than the number according to Khanh Hoa Tourism Master Plan in 2007 of 13,500 people), increased to 48,250 people in 2018 (higher than the nmeber according to this Master Plan in 2007 of 30,800 people); accounting for 30.95% of the total number of employees in the service sector. With 48,250 direct employees operating in 750 accommodation establishments with 39,400 rooms, the average direct number of employees per hotel room in Khanh Hoa province in 2018 was 1.3 (only the number of standard hotel rooms or above) well below the national average of 2.2 (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020). This shows that, although the number of employees in the

tourism industry of Khanh Hoa province is much higher than that in the Khanh Hoa Tourism Master Plan in 2007, it still does not meet the current demand.

# Weak In Quality.

The quality of workers in the tourism industry in Khanh Hoa province is not guaranteed. By the end of 2019, the total number of tour guides issued with practice card in the province is 1,474. That includes 446 domestic tour guides and 1,028 international tour guides (English: 257; Russian: 78; French: 14; German: 05; Chinese: 622; Japanese: 05; Korean: 01; Thai: 01 and 45 bilingual) (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020). Most of tour guides are from other professions, accounting for 17.3%. A large number of them previously worked in other businesses not related to tourism.

It can be confirmed that, tourism brings new face to Khanh Hoa province, but to be able to develop in a sustainable direction, it is necessary to solve a number of issues well, of which the most outstanding are: labor force, especially high quality labor in the service industry in general and in tourism industry in details.

### **Technology**

It can be affirmed that the impact of the Internet on Khanh Hoa province's tourism development is huge. A large part of international tourists coming to Khanh Hoa province is self-organized (especially visitors from Japan, Western Europe, America, and Korea). Thanks to the information technology and communication (ICT), tourism's image of Khanh Hoa province has been widely promoted at home and abroad. Tourists can easily get booking information, make transactions for tickets, hotels, restaurants and other attractions on domestic and international sites like Agoda, booking, trivago, traveloka, chudu24. Most of these travel sites are focused on satisfying all the needs of travelers with many incentives and there are many ways of rating, classifying, especially by price, type, star rating, associated utilities, reviews of people who have experienced (Tien, 2019; Oliver, 1997).

In addition, there are many websites that provide guidance on places to explore, dishes to experience and how to travel in Khanh Hoa province for tourists who do not go on tour. All of this shows that, Khanh Hoa province has been attracting tourists through ICT, a good direction in tourism sustainable development in Vietnam.

# Environmemt

It can be said that tourism development in Khanh Hoa province continues to increase and to maintain growth associated with environmental protection. However, the results have not been as expected. The activities of industrial, urban, aquaculture development at tourist destinations have significant impacts on environmental quality, especially the sea-island environment which is the strength of Khanh Hoa province tourism.

First, the sea water environment. The results of the coastal water environment monitoring at the end of 2017 conducted by the Department of Natural Resources and Environment of Khanh Hoa province showed that if compared with the National Standard OCVN10-MT: 2015 / BTNMT, most of the parameters pH, dissolved oxygen, suspended solids, ammonium, heavy metals (Zn, Cu, Pb, Cd, As), grease and coliforms at the monitoring points all meet the standards. However, some of the following parameters are not qualified at some stations: suspended solids in Ngoc Diem (aquaculture area); coliforms in Bai Dai (beach area), Thuy Trieu swamp (aquaculture area), Van Phong cement factory, My Giang east islet and Song Tac estuary (other region). If compared with the observed data taken in October 2017 at the beginning of the rainy season, suspended solids can be seen to decrease at most stations except the peak of Nha Phu and Ngoc Diem swamp, Cam Ranh port; The level of coliform contamination increased at Bai Dai but decreased sharply in Long Ho bridge. Compared to the same period in 2016: suspended solids increased sharply in Ngoc Diem; coliform values increased at most stations, except for the Nha Phu swamp, April the second Square and Cam Ranh port. Thus, it can be seen that the environmental quality of the coastal water in coastal areas, except for some areas of aquaculture and industry activities, meets the requirements and ensures tourism development activities. However, in some places close to the urban centers, estuarine areas, especially the Cai river, some parameters of coliform, BOD, COD, TSS, ... are still high compared to standards allowed (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020).

Second, the air environment. The monitoring results also show that the quality of the air environment in the whole Khanh Hoa province is basically guaranteed, except for some inner-city points, especially the Nha Trang city (the capital of Khanh Hoa province) at some routes or intersections in peak times. Third, solid waste collection and treatment. This issue has also become a major problem for the Khanh Hoa province's tourism environment, especially in the context of the project to build a solid waste treatment area in the North of the Nha Trang city has not been completed and put into operation as planned.

Fourth, climate change. In recent times, Vietnam in general and Khanh Hoa province in particular have been affected significantly by climate change and sea level rise. This is a global environmental issue but has a significant impact on the socio-economic and tourism sustainable development goals of many countries around the world, including Vietnam as one of the few countries most severely affected. This has caused saline intrusion in estuaries, underground water tanks, affecting the quality of the water environment. The tourism form of diving to watch coral in Nha Trang, Ninh Van waters are gradually losing its attractiveness and disappear due to acidified marine environment, leading to coral bleaching or massive number of dead coral reefs.

### Legal issues

Legal issues in this article focus on analyzing national security guidelines and policies. Apart from Nha Trang city, Khanh Hoa province is also known for Cam Ranh bay, attached to the Cam Ranh military zone. Cam Ranh bay has a very important strategic location, Cam Ranh port is considered as the most

valuable military port in the East Sea (the South China Sea), and is also the most strategic military base of the Vietnam Navy. Because of such geostrategic position, on September 22, 2015, the Prime Minister issued Decision No. 44/2015 / QD-TTg promulgating the regulation to ensure the security and safety of Cam Ranh military base. According to this Decision, Khanh Hoa province will have areas of Mui Hoi (Cam Lap - Cam Ranh), Binh Ba island (Cam Binh - Cam Ranh), Hon Chop (also known as Binh Hung island - Cam Binh commune - Cam Ranh) which are not allowed to conduct or develop any type of tourism. This decision, although affecting the development of spontaneous tourism of people in Cam Binh (Cam Ranh), is still strictly followed by Khanh Hoa province. In 2018, the Department of Planning and Investment of Khanh Hoa province also stopped all activities of the Binh Ba eco-tourism project and the Binh Hung island eco-tourism project (both oth them are granted with investment certificate in 2012). In October 2019, Khanh Hoa province decided to terminate operation and revoke investment certificates for two tourism projects in the Mui Hoi area (Cam Lap - Cam Ranh): project of resort villas and Ecotourism Mui Hoi (about 40 hectares) of Van Phong Co. Ltd. (licensed in 2011) and the Mui Hoi - Ngoc Suong ecotourism area (about 8 hectares) of Ngoc Song Joint Stock Company (licensed in 2012). Cam Binh, Binh Ba and Binh Hung account for 90% of Cam Ranh's tourists and 30% of Cam Ranh's economic structure (KHPC, 2020; KHPCMP, 2020). Although foreign tourists and overseas Vietnamese are not allowed to stay on the island, since then, Cam Ranh has continuously reduced the number of tourists to reach the target of 2020 that no longer to develop tourism in Binh Ba and Binh Hung. This also creates a relatively large pressure for Cam Ranh. This shows that Khanh Hoa province is doing relatively well in developing tourism in parallel with national defense and security protection.

### CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATION

From the analysis and assessment of the sustainability of Khanh Hoa province's tourism according to the PESTEL method, we conclude that Khanh Hoa tourism is on the rise with the goal of making tourism a key economic sector. However, Khanh Hoa province's tourism is not really sustainable. Evaluate the satisfaction and dissatisfaction of tourists in some countries with their tour in Khanh Hoa province, we find that 90% of tourists are satisfied. Among the reasons for dissatisfaction, we must pay attention to: Being cheated when buying goods or services; The safety in traffic is not high; The service staff is poor in foreign languages; Tour guides are not professional and not enthusiastic. Economically, the structure of tourists is too focused on one market (the Chinese market) and is strongly affected by the COVID-19 (Anh et al, 2021). The average spending of Chinese tourists is not high because Vietnam has not yet exploited tourists from China's top cities.

Socially, high-quality human resources in the tourism industry in Khanh Hoa province are both weak and lacking (Hau et al, 2019). Environmentally, Khanh Hoa province's tourism is being significantly affected by the environment because the industrial development activities to attract tourists are taking place strongly and not closely controlled. Especially, Khanh Hoa province's tourism is being affected by climate change ().

# In Order To Solve The Above Problems, The Study Would Like To Give Some Of The Following Suggestions:

In terms of vision, Khanh Hoa province needs to develop own sustainable development strategy, comprehensive solutions and specific measures to well exploit the potentials and fundamental advantages for developing marine tourism destinations; build and preserve cultural values of coastal fishermen, develop marine conservation zones and coastal local products to serve the tourists (Vinh et al, 2019 & 2019b).

Economically, to expand the attraction of domestic and foreign tourists, trying to create a sustainable tourist market. With the domestic tourist market, at present, Khanh Hoa province in particular and Vietnam in general are trying to attract international tourists but seem to forget the potential domestic tourist market. According to statistics, the number of domestic tourists is always higher than international tourists. Khanh Hoa province should focus on this market by creating unique products to serve the needs of Vietnamese. With the foreign tourist market, Khanh Hoa province tries to expand the attraction of tourists, creating a more balanced tourist structure, limiting dependence on one or several tourist markets. The COVID-19 pandemic took place, along with the sharp decline in the Chinese and Russian tourist market. It is important to increase the average tourist expenditure by enhancing the quality of tourism growth. To do so, it is necessary to focus on exploiting the tourist market in countries such as the US, UK, Germany. In case of China, Khanh Hoa province should try to exploit the tourist market in developed cities of China such as the Beijing, Shanghai, etc. Along with exploiting international tourist markets in developed countries, Khanh Hoa province needs to improve the quality of tourism products. Tourism products need planning to demonstrate the scale, cultural identity, and identity of local cuisine. Food service always needs to be associated with typical and traditional local products along with ensuring reasonable price, service style, hygiene and safety (Tien, 2018a & 2018b).

In terms of social factors, high quality human resources in Khanh Hoa province's tourism industry should be focused on timely and planned supplements in both short and long term. Especially when the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) was formed, creating a fierce competition for high-quality human resources regionally, especially in the tourism industry. The human resources in the tourism industry of Khanh Hoa province in particular and of Vietnam in general, if not increased in quantity and improved in quality, it is very difficult to compete at home with the human resources in better developed countries in the region (such as: Singapore, Malaysia and Thailand). To solve this problem, it is necessary to strongly cooperate between three parties: the State, training institutions and enterprises.

To the State of Vietnam in general and Khanh Hoa province in particular, we need to: Renovate the structure of the education system on the basis of national qualification framework, the appropriate professional and soft skill standards with the national context and trends in the region and the world; To build a national database on vocational education and modernize IT infrastructure serving the management of vocational education. To step up the construction of

an electronic library and online training system and encourage local educational institutions to build multi-media and specialized rooms; simulation and virtual reality system; Strengthen multilateral and bilateral cooperation in the field of education and training, such as: scientific research, academic exchange, training for teachers and management staff, create favorable legal and social conditions for foreign investors to open educational institutions in Khanh Hoa province.

For training institutions, it is necessary to: Train high-quality human resources, capable of management services related to tourism; Focusing on skills training and workforce readiness; Enhance core soft skills such as communication, teamwork, creative, analytical thinking, foreign languages; Renovate the organization of modular and credit system and develop online training. The training program must be designed flexibly, meet the output professional standards, creating linkages between qualifications and occupations; Change methods towards student-centered training with the application of ICT in lesson design and delivery of lectures. Renew forms and methods of testing in education to meet students' future goals of working capacity and creativity.

For businesses the benefits always come with responsibilities. In order to attract skilled workforce, enterprises basically need to pay attention to the following points: Closely coordinate with training institutions and create environment for trainees to practice and work officially.

Regarding the environment, it is necessary to: issue sanctions on companies' discharges into the environment. At the same time, it is necessary to pay special attention to and protect the coral reefs amongst others in Nha Trang city. At least to minimize the bad human impacts caused by the tourism development process.

# **REFERENCES:**

- Anh, D. B. H. & Tien, N. H. (2019). Agrotourism as Factor of Entrepreneurship in the Countryside Development. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN FINANCE AND MANAGEMENT", Vol. 2, No. 1, 53-55.
- Anh, D. B. H., Nguyen Diu Huong, Tien, N. H., Nguyen Minh Ngoc, Nguyen Thi Thanh Huong, & To Ngoc Minh Phuong (2021). Sustainable development of tourism industry in post Covid-19 period in Vietnam. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL MULTIDISCIPLINARY RESEARCH AND GROWTH EVALUATION", Vol. 1, No. 5, 88-94.
- Barkauskasa, V., Barkauskiene, K., &Jasinskasc, K. (2015). Analysis of macro environmental factors influencing the development of rural tourism: Lithuanian case. *Procedia Social and Behavioural Sciences*, 213(1), 167-172.
- Beerli, A., & Martin, J. D. (2004). Factors influencing destination image. *Analysis of Tourism Research*, 31(3), 657-681.
- Butler, R. (1991). Tourism, environment, and sustainable development. Environmental Conservation.
- Davidoff, M. (1994). Contact: customer service in the hospitality and tourism industry, Englewood Cliffs, *New Jersey: Prentice Hall Career and Technology*.

- Diedrich, A., & Aswani, S. (2016). Exploring the potential impacts of tourism development on social and ecological change in the Solomon Islands. Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences.
- Duc, P. M., Tien, N. H., Nguyen Thanh Tuan, Phung The Vinh, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019). Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc Comparative Analysis of Potential for Tourism Industry Development. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 138-141.
- Dung, H. T., Tien, N. H., & Nguyen Van Tien (2019). Brand Building for Vietnam Tourism Industry Reality and Solutions. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 1, No. 2, 63-68.
- Dung, H. T., Tien, N. H., Nguyen Thanh Vu, & Le Doan Minh Duc (2019a). Risks of Unsustainable Tourism Development in Vietnam. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN FINANCE AND MANAGEMENT", Vol. 2, No. 2, 81-85.
- Gabriel, B., Condruta, A. B., Nicoleta, A. N., Dana, B., Ovidiu, M.T., & Anca, M. (2017). Approaching the sustainable development practices in mountain tourism in the Romanian Carpathians. *Sustainability*, 9, 20-51.
- Goeldner, R., Ritchie, B., & McIntosh, W. (2000). Tourism: Principles, Practices, Philosophies, 8th ed, *New YorkL John Wiley and Sons*.
- Gossling, S. (2002). Global environmental consequences of tourism. *Global Environment Change*, 12(4), 283-302.
- Gossling, S., & Peeters, P. (2015). Assessing tourism's global environmental impact 1900–2050. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 23(5), 639-659.
- Harris, R., Griffin, T., & Williams, P. (2002). Sustainable tourism: A global perspective. (2nd Ed.). Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford.
- Hau, T. H., Tien, N. H., Tran Minh Thai, Phung The Vinh, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019). Developing Human Resource for Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc Tourism Industry. Comparative Analysis. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 1-5.
- KHPC (2020). People's Committee of Khanh Hoa Province: Khanh Hoa Tourism Development Master Plan to 2020, http://www.nhatrang-travel.com/index.php?cat=3002&type=1&itemid=334
- KHPCMP (2020). People's Committee of Khanh Hoa province: Master plan on tourism development of Khanh Hoa province to 2025 and orientation to 2030 (draft)
- KHDST (2020). Department of Science and Technology of Khanh Hoa province: Science and Technology development plan of Khanh Hoa province to 2020, vision to 2030, http://www.dostkhanhhoa.gov.vn/tabid/115/ID /48/language/vi-VN/Default.aspx
- Kotler, P., & Keller, L. (2006). Marketing management 12th Ed, Upper Saddle, River, *Pearson*.
- Kozak, M., & Rimmington, M. (2000). Tourist satisfaction with Mallorca, Spain, as an off-season holiday destination, *Journal of Travel Research*, Vol. 38, PP.260-269.

- Lucchetti, M. C., & Arcese, G. (2014). Tourism management and industrial ecology: A Theoretical review. *Sustainability*, 6, 4900-4909.
- McKercher, B. (1993). Some fundamental truths about tourism: understanding tourism's social, and environmental impacts. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1, 6–16.
- Meimand, S., Khalifah, Z., Hakemi, H. (2013). Expectation and experience gap for Japanese travelers visiting Malaysian homestay, utilizing holiday satisfaction model, *Indian journal of science and technology*, Vol 6(12), PP. 5593-5599.
- Muller, H. (1994). The thorny path to sustainable tourism development. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 2(3), 131-136.
- NTOTD (2020). Orientation of tourism development in Nha Trang to 2030, https://cocobaynhatrang.com/dinh-huong-phat-trien-du-lich-nha-trang-den-nam-2030/
- Oliver, R. (1997). Satisfaction: A behavioral perspective on the consumer. Singapore: *McGraw Hill*.
- Pearce, D. G. (1997). Competitive destination analysis in Southeast Asia. *Journal of Travel Research.*, 35(4): 16-24.
- Petrovic, M. D., Lukic, D., Radovanovic, M., Vujko, A., Gajic, T., & Vukovic, D. (2017). Urban geosites as potential geotourism destinations: Evidence from Belgrade. *Open Geosocial*, 9, 442-456.
- Reisinger, Y., & Turner, L. (2003). Cross-Cultural Behavior in Tourism: Concepts and Analysis Cornwal: *MPG books Ltd*.
- Ritchie, J.R., & Brent, Z. M. (1978). Culture as determinant of the attractiveness of a region", *Annals of Tourism Research* V (2): 252–67.
- Sunlu, U. (2003). Environmental impacts of tourism. CIHEM.
- Retrieved from <a href="http://om.ciheam.org/om/pdf/a57/04001977.pdf">http://om.ciheam.org/om/pdf/a57/04001977.pdf</a>.
- Thai, T. M., Tran Hoang Hau, Tien, N. H., Phung The Vinh, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019). Solutions for Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc International Tourism Promotion. Comparative Analysis. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 108-112.
- Thai, T. M., Tien, N. H., Tran Hoang Hau, Phung The Vinh, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019a). Solutions for Attracting FDI into Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc Tourism Industry. Comparative Analysis. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 113-119.
- Thang, P. N. (2009), The role of community-based tourism in poverty alleviation, Vietnam Tourism Magazine, No. 6/2009.
- Thuy, N. T. N., & Ngoc, Q. T. K. (2014), Forecast of human resources demand of 4–5-star hotels in Nha Trang city Khanh Hoa province, Journal of Fisheries Science and Technology, No. 1/2014.
- Thuy, T. T. & Nga, P. T. T. (2013), Development of sea and island tourism in Khanh Hoa province, Scientific Journal of Ho Chi Minh City Pedagogical University. Ho Chi Minh.
- Tien, N. H., Nguyen Minh Ngoc, & Dinh Ba Hung Anh (2020). Sustainability of Coastal Tourism Development: Comparative Analysis of Vietnam's Northern and Souththern Provinces. "JOURNAL OF SOUTHWEST JIAOTONG UNIVERSITY", Vol. 55, No. 6.

- Tien, N. H. (2019). CRM Application in Managing Hotel, Restaurant and Tourism Services in Vietnam. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MANAGEMENT", Vol. 1, No. 1, 14-17.
- Tien, N. H. (2018). Solutions for Sustainable Development of Binh Duong Tourism. Proceedings of University Scientific Conference on: "Binh Duong Tourism, Enhancing Competitiveness towards Sustainable Development", 55-67. Binh Duong Department of Culture, Sport and Tourism. December 2018.
- Tien, N. H. (2018a). Hanoi Culture of Cuisine as Factor Attracting Tourists to Vietnam. Proceedings of University Scientific Conference on: "Values of Gastronomic Culture in Tourist Activities", 101-105. Faculty of Social Science and Humanities, Department of Culture and Tourism. 21 May 2018, Tien Giang University.
- Tien, N. H. (2018b). Street Foods as a Touch of Beauties in Vietnamese Culture of Cuisine. Proceedings of University Scientific Conference on: "Values of Gastronomic Culture in Tourist Activities", 182-187. Faculty of Social Science and Humanities, Department of Culture and Tourism. 21 May 2018, Tien Giang University.
- Tien, N. H. (2017c). Agrotourism as a Factor of Entrepreneurship Development in Rural Areas. Proceedings of University Scientific Conference on "Sustainable Development and Climate Change", October 2017, TDM University, Faculty of Environment Management and Natural Resources.
- Tien, N. H. (2015). Leadership in socially responsible enterprises. Ementon publisher, Warsaw.
- Tourism Law (2015). XIth National Assembly, No. 44/2005 / QH11, June 14, 2005.
- Tuan, N. T., Tien, N. H., Phan Minh Duc, Phung The Vinh, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019). Differences and Similarities in Offered Services of Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc Tourism Industry. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 120-125.
- Tuu, H. H. & Cam, T. T. A. (2012). Positive intention to return and word of mouth by international tourists towards Nha Trang. Economic Development Journal, 262: 55-62
- Van, N. T., & Trai, N. V. (2015). "Sustainable development of marine tourism in Khanh Hoa province", Master thesis, Nha Trang University.
- Viet, P. Q., Nguyen Minh Duc, Tien, N. H., & Vo Thi Tam (2020). Sustainability of Tourism Development in Vietnam's Coastal Provinces. "WORLD REVIEW OF ENTREPRENEURSHIP MANAGEMENT AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT", (accepted)
- Vinh, P. T., Tien, N. H., Nguyen Thanh Tuan, Phan Minh Duc, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019). Taking Advantages of the Potential of Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc in Developing Tourism Industry. Comparative Analysis. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 126-130.
- Vinh, P. T., Tien, N. H., Tran Minh Thai, Tran Hoang Hau, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019a). Solutions for Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc Tourism Industry Sustainable Development. Comparative Analysis.

- "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 101-107.
- Vinh, P. T, Phan Minh Duc, Tien, N. H., Nguyen Thanh Tuan, & Nguyen Vuong Thanh Long (2019b). Solutions for Tuyen Quang and Binh Phuoc International Tourism Products and Services Development. Comparative Analysis. "INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN MARKETING MANAGEMENT AND SALES", Vol. 2, No. 1, 131-137.
- VNAT (2015). Vietnam National Administration of Tourism (http://vietnamtourism.gov.vn/index.php/items/13462)
- Vy, N. V. (2016). "The economic development of tourism in Khanh Hoa province", Master thesis, Nha Trang University.
- UNEP (2014). Marketing Tourism More Sustainable: A Guide for Policy Makers. United Nations Environment Program, World Tourism Organisation.
- UNWTO (2015). UN World Tourism Organization (2015): "Tourism Hightlights 2014".
- Villanueva-Alvaro, J. J., Mondejar-Jimenez, J., & Saez-Martinez, F. J. (2017). Rural tourism: Development, management and sustainability in rural establishments. *Sustainability*, 9, pp. 818
- Zainal, A., Radzi, S.M., Hashim, R., Chik, C.T., & Abu, R. (2012). Current Issues in Hospitality and Tourism: Research and Innovations, CRC Press: Leiden, The Netherlands.